



Musical Hybridity in Flux: Representing Race, Colonial Policy, and Modernity in French North Africa, 1860s-1930s

Jann Pasler*

Abstract

Colonialism posed the challenge of coexistence amid almost insurmountable differences. Music had long been considered an audible representation of these differences, the performance of intelligence, character, and even soul. However, if music offered a way to understand traditions and values of other peoples, the context for this was racial theories - monogenism and polygenism - and racial hierarchies based on stereotypes. Depending on one's orientation, studying African music was either a step toward an imagined universalism in the language of music or a mode for contemplating racial distinctions, both helping the French reflect on the ideology of Western superiority.

At the same time, music was capable of far more. Because, as art, its meaning is never entirely graspable, music seemed neutral, a domain that could be shared. In this sense, some wanted it to assist in the process of assimilation, thereby infusing energy into the colonial process.

Résumé

Le colonialisme a posé le défi de la coexistence dans un milieu marqué par des différences quasi-insurmontables. La musique a longtemps été considérée comme une représentation sonore de ces différences, la manifestation de l'intelligence, du caractère, et même de l'âme. Toutefois, si la musique constituait un moyen de comprendre les traditions et les valeurs des autres peuples, le contexte en était les théories raciales – le monogénisme et le polygénisme – et les hiérarchies raciales fondées sur des stéréotypes. En fonction de son orientation, l'étude de la musique africaine était soit une étape vers un universalisme imaginé dans le langage de la musique, ou un mode de réflexion sur les distinctions raciales, permettant à la fois d'aider les Français à réfléchir sur l'idéologie de la supériorité occidentale.

Dans le même temps, la musique était capable de bien plus. Parce que, en tant qu'art dont le sens n'est jamais totalement saisissable, la musique semblait revêtir un caractère neutre, appartenant au domaine du partageable. En ce sens, d'aucuns ont voulu qu'elle facilite le processus d'assimilation, insufflant ainsi un nouvel élan au processus colonial.

*

Colonialism posed the challenge of coexistence amid almost insurmountable differences. Music had long been considered an audible representation of these differences, the performance of intelligence, character, and even soul. As Jules Rouanet wrote of Algerian music in 1905, 'avec cette musique l'âme d'un grand peuple a palpité' (Rouanet 1906:150). However, if music offered a way to understand traditions and values of other peoples, the context for this was racial theories - monogenism and polygenism - and racial hierarchies based on stereotypes. Depending on one's orientation, studying African music was either a step toward an imagined universalism in the language of music or a mode for contemplating racial distinctions, both helping the French reflect on the ideology of Western superiority.

At the same time, music was capable of far more. Because, as art, its meaning is never entirely graspable, music seemed neutral, a domain that could be shared. In this sense, some wanted it to assist in the process of assimilation, thereby infusing energy into the colonial process. Through western songs taught in schools and liturgical music sung in local languages or performed on indigenous instruments in the missions, the colonized would take the *mœurs* and values of the colonizer literally into their bodies. Moreover, performance on western instruments-by locals in their own western-style orchestras² or wind bands-could be understood as suggesting latent respect for French culture. And because music is not entirely dependent on language and could also potentially transcend the limits and location of cultures, it was a window onto diasporic movements in history. In Africa, as elsewhere, music was inevitably a product of multiple influences, not only local traditions but also those accompanying people in migrations and invasions-the result of layers of negotiation of Self and Other. African musical scales were studied as not only remnants of the distant past - like the shards of archaeological ruins-but also the product of hybridities. Certain musical intervals suggested links between North Africa and ancient Greece, others between North Africa and Turkey. When Republicans came to power, they saw such cultural collisions as nourishing, inducing progress. Music, as a metaphor for society, could be a potential source of vitality.

Under French colonialism, composers, performers, and scholars forged a variety of musical hybridities. After examining the meaning of hybridity in 19th-century France, I look at three genres in which European and African music were brought into hybrid relationships: piano/vocal transcriptions of African melodies (the most contentious of the three and the subject to which I devote the most attention); orchestral music that incorporates African melodies, rhythms, and timbres; and marches with narratives of not only triumph, but also accommodation and resistance. What aspects of music could be shared to make hybridity possible? If hybrid means giving up

something to gain something else, what were these musicians willing to give up, what specifically did they hope to gain? And what were the racial, political, and historical as well as musical implications of their hybridities?

Under Napoléon III, Francisco Salvador Daniel, composer and violinist of Spanish roots, born in France and living in Algeria from 1853 to 1870, transcribed music from Algiers, Tunis, and Kabylie not only to make this music available to westerners, but also to explore how differences in European and African culture might be negotiated and how European/African coexistence might work. If his focus on Kabyles, the indigenous people of Algeria, reinforced the empire's military agendas, his transcriptions of their rural music were also found important by socialist Communards, music historians, and later French republicans. These transcriptions also set the standard to which later ethnomusicologists in North Africa responded and reacted.

Under assimilationist colonialism - French policy, in theory, 1870-1900 - differences were appreciated especially for their use-value. Some French hoped that appropriating foreign ideas and products could lead to innovation, possibly to new commodities. At first this meant bringing exotic plants and animals to France, in places such as the Jardin d'Acclimatation in Paris where it was determined which species could acclimatize to France and what economic and social utility they could serve. While most French living abroad took little interest in indigenous music, Camille Saint-Saëns collected and incorporated what he heard on visits to North Africa. Orchestral works like his *Suite Algérienne* (1881), *Africa* (1892), and the Concerto no. 5 (1895), 'l'Égyptien,' are complex and provocative as the composer's motivations are not obvious. Because the Other here is more than a function of the composer's imagination, was the composer attempting to stimulate curiosity and interest in the continent, as might a tourist after an *agréable séjour*, or was he merely paying tribute to his own impressions? Was he writing to encourage escape, albeit an imaginary or vicarious one, creating a fantasy on which western listeners can project their own desires? Or was he pointing to racial differences and diversity and how they inevitably coexist? Using African materials to infuse his music with new scales, sonorities, and rhythms, the composer points to new musical resources in Africa as potentially rich in implications as the continent's natural resources. Engaging with the Other's difference thus could push on the boundaries of Western sound, for the French a musical benefit of colonial expansion. As I show, however, there is more to the story than appropriation and exploitation. Saint-Saëns also explored what kind of coexistence is possible between European and African tastes and practices, albeit, like Daniel, from a French perspective.

Through their use of African tunes and other gestures, marches too played a role in colonialism. Here I only touch on this vast topic with a few examples

from both French and African music, emphasizing that the genre was used not just to represent pride and glory through conquest, but also to reproduce these feelings through resistance, the weak to the strong. And while the *tirailleurs africains* performed marches on indigenous instruments as part of the French military, the Beni *ngoma* of East Africa reinterpreted western military marches for their own ends.

After 1900, however, French attitudes toward hybridity changed, including for Saint-Saëns and those supporting, collecting, and transcribing African music. With Jacques Bertillon's study of depopulation among the French (more deaths than births) in the 1890s, anti-colonialist sentiment in the metropole (especially during the Madagascar expedition in 1895-96), and deep fault-lines in the French assimilationist project abroad, came racial panic (fear of racial degeneration) and increasing resistance to anything hybrid. Hybridity became associated with the potential loss of vitality, such as Gobineau associated with racial mixing. In music too, increasingly criticized for the unforeseen consequences of hybridity, some resisted 'fusion'. In France, it was a reaction to the influence on French music of the German composer Richard Wagner and his fusion of symphonic and dramatic music. In Africa, among music scholars, there was anxiety about the impact of not only European music, but also Turkish and Egyptian music, contemporary recordings, and other modern musical practices, as if they would inhibit music's function as an emblem of soul or sign to the distant past. With the shift to associationist colonial policies and French focus on the difference represented by indigenous arts came the search for 'pure' African music, unaffected by the compromises of hybridity. This led to increased valorisation of the urban classical musical tradition in North Africa, brought from the Andalusian courts. If intensified French participation in the collection and dissemination of indigenous music after 1900 showed respect for local cultures, it also implicated the French in shaping both the musical histories of their North African colonies and the tastes of their elites, with important ramifications still today.

This music and the ideologies behind its hybridities thus encourage us to reflect on issues at the heart of the colonial process: new meanings and new functions for indigenous materials, removed from their original contexts, and the consequences of these; ambiguities of authorship and ownership between those who produce source material and those who make new use of it; the nature of collaboration among Africans and Westerners when collecting indigenous melodies and transcribing and/or adapting them for western contexts; and the extent to which musical hybridity can involve mutual appropriation and mutual assimilation. In conclusion, we must ask, was hybridity capable of unsettling the binary oppositions of Self and Other?

And was the authenticity that purportedly stood opposed to it in Arabo-Andalusian classical music necessarily a more accurate or desirable expression of the Self, especially in the modern era?

French Hybridity, Race, and Music:

Salvador Daniel's Transcriptions of North African Music

Long before the postmodern and postcolonial preoccupation with hybridization and the impact of migrations, North Africans were aware that their cultures were the product of not only migrations from Spain, but also a succession of invaders-Phoenicians, Greeks, Romans, and then western Europeans-their history the result of both assimilation and resistance. What has been far less recognized is that many French of the late 19th century, even as they were preoccupied with asserting their national identity, felt a deep-seated anxiety about their own racial hybridity. While French republicans wanted to believe in the Revolutionary notion of the Republic as 'one and indivisible' (Chapman and Frader 2004), and sought an identity that would distinguish them from their neighbours, they had to come to grips with a past characterized not by homogeneous coherence, but by invasions, conflict, and accommodation. Celts, Gauls, Romans, Franks, Southerners and Northerners, the people and the nobility, colonized peoples and *émigrés*, each formed part of the fabric of French identity.

Historians, such as Fustel de Coulanges, struggled with the transnational nature of peoples like the Celts who, living in northern Europe and southern Germany as well as France, raised questions about the relationship between race, culture, and nation. More recently, Homi Bhabha has returned to this concern, defining culture as a 'strategy of survival' (Bhabha 1994:172)³. But the anthropologist Paul Broca saw no problem in this complexity. He proposed that the French exemplify 'eugenic hybridity', a people 'formed by the intermixture [*croisement*] of two or more races' that is 'indefinitely prolific'. Their mixing had not caused loss of fertility, vigour, or intelligence: 'Far from decaying or presenting a decreasing fecundity, this hybrid nation grows every day in intelligence, prosperity, and numbers' (Broca 1864:16-18, 21-22). At the end of the 19th century, the sociologist Alfred Fouillé used a musical metaphor to describe how, over time, these different peoples, each with their own set of assets and liabilities, came into 'une harmonie rare et précieuse'. Careful to point out what each race contributed to the mixture, Fouillé suggested how the French escaped physical and environmental determinism by becoming 'une sorte d'accord parfait où le Celte donne la tonique, le Méditerranéen la médiate et le Germain la dominante,' their mental as well as physical attributes in balance and equilibrium (Lavignac 1895:441)⁴. As such, it appeared that 'la France résume l'Europe et que, au point de vue

de la race et du caractère comme au point de vue du climat, nous avons en nous quelque chose des plus diverses contrées européennes' (Fouillé 1895). This idea, which spoke to French ambitions about their place in Europe as well as the world beyond, was meant to bolster their sense of superiority, particularly amid the *fin-de-siècle* panic over possible degeneration (Pasler 2006:459-504).

Although the formation of something hybrid tends to involve antagonism, resistance, and subjugation, and vastly different theories have arisen to explain how and why this may have worked in France, many 19th-century French, given their own history, clung to the purported advantages of assimilation. In Algeria, even if there was little intermarrying between French and Muslims and few Muslim children attended French schools, Paul Leroy-Beaulieu believed that French *moeurs* and tastes could serve as 'ferment' in the vast Muslim population of North Africa (Leroy-Beaulieu 1874, 1886:331). Those who thought that the Arabs could never be assimilated, in part because of their religion, looked to the Spanish, Italian, and Maltese living in North Africa to join the French in forming a 'new Mediterranean race,' a vigorous and virile product of the intermingling of Europeans and locals willing to embrace France⁵. Through shared schools and cultural activities, such as music and theatre, the French sought to promote their values, eventually naturalizing others of European descent as well as Jews. As such, the 'French' population in North Africa itself was hybrid (Leroy-Beaulieu 1874, 1886:316). Anthropologists who worked on Algeria believed, like Broca, that when hybridity results from 'proximate species' as opposed to distant ones, 'unions between allied races are fertile'⁶. Given a high birth rate among these Latin peoples, Paul Bert thought they might one day dominate Algeria (Bert 1885:6). One of the arguments for promoting such hybridity came from Louis Bertrand, a native of Lorraine who taught at the Algiers Lycée. Like many archaeologists studying the Roman ruins in North Africa, he saw the region as originally part of a Latin Mediterranean diaspora. Hybridity was integral to its nature.

Music and musical instruments, in their ability to embody and recall the past, were studied for what light they might shed on racial origins and hierarchies, migrations and hybridity⁷. While few French historians acknowledged influences that remained from the twenty years Spanish Arabs settled near Lyon and Maçon, the Egyptian music scholar Victor Loret found remnants in numerous songs in the Pyrénées (Loret 1917: 166-171). Particularly interesting in terms of music documenting intercultural contact between the North and the South are essays on Arab music (1860s) by Francisco Salvador Daniel (1831-1871). These were based on nine years of research in Algeria, performances with North African musicians, and transcription of some four hundred local songs. From them, he observed

similarities between Arab and medieval church modes (musical scales). Like others who studied non-western music as if frozen in the distant past, he jumped without much evidence to the conclusion that contemporary Arab music was 'rien autre chose que le chant des Trouvères' and could help Europeans understand 'la musique des premiers siècles de l'Ere chrétienne' (Daniel 1879:4-6, 13, 17). More significant were resemblances he perceived between Arab and ancient Greek modes and between the Tunisian guitar, the Kouitra, and the kithara of ancient Greece, as if Roman invaders may have brought these with their civilization (Daniel 1879:20). Claiming not to have heard any 'intervalles de tiers et de quart de ton' in Arab music (Daniel 1879:4, Weckerkin 1864 and Farmer n.d.:204-205)⁸, Daniel argued that Arab music shared with ancient Greek music eight diatonic modes (made of tones and semitones) as well as four chromatic modes. Finding different versions of the same songs, what interested him most was not trying to 'retrouver la première formule' or the 'originale' of each melody (Daniel 1879:158-159)- his successors' preoccupation. He noticed that the mode remained constant, and mode signalled race for him more than any other element.

For political, racial, and musical reasons, Kabyle music in particular attracted Daniel. First, it seemed to resonate with his complicated politics. Salvador Daniel grew up royalist and Catholic, sympathetic to the Emperor, though he later became a 'revolutionary socialist'⁹. Like other Frenchmen of the time, he believed the Kabyles were 'la vraie population indigène au nord de l'Afrique.' Fascinated with the warrior music he heard in Kabylie just before and during the French expedition there in 1857, Daniel focused on the Kabyles' use of the Phrygian scale, with its tritones (three whole tones) dissonant to Westerners. Daniel associated it with not only the Kabyles' strength and ferocity, but also their pride in 'avoir toujours été libre, et ne s'est soumis que récemment à la domination française'¹⁰. Such an attitude was also consonant with French military policy. The French often sought support among indigenous peoples, pushed into the hills in both Indochina and Algeria by previous invaders. Indeed, Salvador Daniel dedicated his 1863 book on Arabic music to the War Minister, Le Maréchal Comte Randon. Its first page explains that the chapters appeared in *Revue Africaine*, the journal of the Société historique Algérienne, founded under the Comte's auspices. Even more important, it was the Comte's support- 'la haute protection dont vous avez bien voulu m'honorer'- that allowed Daniel to undertake this study of Arabic music and the Comte himself to whom he owed 'sa position en Algérie'¹¹. Daniel also acknowledged the 'encouragements' he had received from 'chefs des bureaux arabes' (Daniel 1879:37). In 1866, a month after his transcriptions were performed in Paris, Napoléon III recognized Daniel's work with a gold medal.

Second, Daniel was drawn to Kabyle music because its Phrygian scale reminded him of the Greek Phrygian, one of four Greek chromatic genres. This observation convinced him that Kabyles were descendants of ancient Greeks as well as, distantly, French Celts. Daniel contended that (1) since Kabyle songs often used the Phrygian mode as Plutarch described it, (2) since Kabyle songs in this mode were usually accompanied by the flute, according to Plutarch also as in ancient Greece, and (3) since certain religious customs of contemporary Kabyles were 'reproductions' of the sacred rites of the Phrygian Cabires, then Kabyles were most likely descendants of 'la grande famille aryenne des Pélasges, premiers occupants de la Phrygia et pères de la caste cabirque'¹². Gobineau had identified the Pélasges as the 'habitants primitifs' of France, and their 'origine Celtique ou Slave' (Gobineau 1853, 1983:791). Moreover, the Phrygian mode in French folk songs and cabiric-like sacrifices among the Celtic Gauls suggested that the Celtic family too belonged to the Greek Pélasges. Later scholars reiterated these observations. Finding Arab pieces in the Phrygian and Hypolydian modes in his 1904 collection of Algerian music, Jules Rouanet too claimed that Arab music had its roots in ancient Greece, as did Alexis Chottin in his 1928 study of Moroccan music (Rouanet and Yafil 1904; Chottin 1928:14). Such theories suggested that, although Daniel provided more affirmations than proof, North African music seemed a potential source of knowledge about ancient Greek music: knowledge of the Other was capable of enhancing knowledge of the Self.

Common musical scales supported the theory that the French and the Kabyles had similar ancestors-with important political implications. French ethnographers had long considered the Kabyles a 'sister population' in that, other than with their Islamic religion, they espoused a way of life resembling the French one. Their sedentary, farming culture preserved in the mountains had given them a sense of private property, a quasi-democratic organization with civil laws, and the practice of monogamy, whereas Arabs were understood as essentially nomadic, feudal, and polygamous. The distinctions of race thus transmuted into distinctions of history and culture to promote positive qualities of Kabyles as opposed to negative qualities associated with Arabs. Daniel was not alone in considering these mountain peoples descendants of Celts, Aryans, or at least a people with the same ancestors. Emile Masqueray, who ran the Ecole Supérieure de Lettres in Alger (1872-1894) and produced the only scholarly work on the Kabyles in those years, compared Kabyle villages to the primitive villages of both classical Rome and Greece as well as Auvergne and Savoy in France. He was convinced that studying these 'small republics' would shed light on the 'institutional origins

of Western civilization' (Bert 1885:34 and Lorcin 1995:189-190). Common racial origins offered justification for French occupation and colonialism.

Third, Salvador Daniel was drawn to kabyle music for the challenge of understanding 'cette musique essentiellement primitive' as well as trying to reproduce the 'effet sauvage' of its tritones 'dont la dureté est très appréciable pour tout le monde' (Daniel 1879:158, 162). The fruits of his years of study resulted in not only his book and articles, but also transcriptions of Algerian, Tunisian, Kabyle, and Maltese melodies into western notation documenting this tradition and making it available to westerners. Most were for solo voice with piano accompaniment. In many ways, these hybrid creations should be understood in the tradition of 19th-century *chanson populaire* transcriptions. First, as signifiers of culture and race, such songs were understood as melodic 'types' with allusions to racial types, as Julien Tiersot once explained, although in North Africa, as in France, migrations and intermarriage (such as among the Kabyles and Arabs) had long made the notion of distinct racial differences far more imagined than real. At the same time, as Tiersot pointed out, 'la mélodie populaire est chose essentiellement fluide, malléable, infiniment délicate et susceptible de se transformer sous les influences les plus diverses; que parfois le peuple ... n'est qu'adaptateur, arrangeur des matières déjà existantes, et que dans certain cas ... il ne fait que s'emprunter à lui-même des éléments traditionnels qui lui appartiennent depuis de longues générations' (Tiersot 1894:29-30). Although the musical mode tended to not change from one performer or town to another and 'par conséquent, le caractère d'ensemble du morceau,' Daniel also remarked on having found variants of the same melodies in different regions, with one he first heard in Tunis 'considérablement amoindri et défiguré' by the time it made it to Algiers (Daniel 1879:158-159). These attributes made melodies particularly apt for what the French called 'acclimatation.' To acclimatize an object, individual, or race meant to remove it from its place of origin and imprint on its organization modifications that rendered it able to perpetuate its species under new conditions (Saint-Hilaire 1849). Because the western violin was too powerful for urban Arabs, for example, in Morocco they used a viola tuned as a violin (Chottin 1928:14). Calling on the mechanism of racial transformation in analysing the effects of regional differences on musical production in France, Tiersot saw song variants from one province to another as the result of 'acclimatation musicale'. The process, however, was far from neutral. Anthropologist Armand de Quatrefages, who understood acclimatization as the victory of milieu over an organism that bends to its requirements, acknowledged that this never takes place without a more or less violent struggle and leads to loss for individuals and generations (Quatrefages 1883:373-375).

The most compromising aspect of musical acclimatization derived from the transcription of melodies into conventional western notation. Even the transcribers themselves were frustrated with their inability to indicate microtones and subtle timbres¹³. To make matters worse, to facilitate performances on western instruments like the piano, many transcribers often added harmony, cadences, and other accoutrements of western art song, including instrumental introductions, interludes, and codas. With folksongs of the French provinces, 'charmants débris de l'art primitif de notre race', Julien Tiersot chose to 'les habiller d'un vêtement d'harmonie'. His reasoning: 'Notre seule pensée, en les transportant dans un milieu si différent de leur milieu naturel, a été de les présenter de telle façon qu'elles ne semblassent pas dès l'abord par trop dépayssées'. When these songs were performed in concert halls, perhaps not surprisingly Tiersot was often listed as their 'composer'. If composers used these melodies as 'sujets' for their symphonies, this would be 'une nouvelle preuve de leur vitalité toujours renaissante' (Tiersot 1888:1 and 1911:3; Pasler 207:156-158).

Daniel believed transcription of North African music into western notation was possible because Arabic music was based on tones and semi-tones (for example Clément 1861, 1878:63), as in western music, and clear rhythms. Like Tiersot, he used key signatures to indicate basic tonality, western musical meters to establish the rhythm, and metronome markings to set tempo. Moreover, Daniel was careful to use accidentals to signal non-tonal melodic movement. Suggesting that his intended audience was Westerners, Daniel also presented words in his songs in approximate French translations, 'imitations' of the original Arabic. But unlike Tiersot, who ignored provincial dialects, Daniel also reproduced his song titles in their original language, indicated the modes, and occasionally noted performers' names and place of performance.

The most remarkable aspect of Daniel's transcriptions are his piano accompaniments. Unlike in transcriptions of most French *chansons populaires*, the piano rarely doubles the vocal part, remaining more distinct¹⁴. Daniel added chordal harmonies in the piano parts, but not always to force western harmony on the vocal part. If, for example, in 'Stamboul' diminished sevenths on F# resolve to G major, in 'Le Ramier,' there is a leading tone on D# in cadences (in E minor) in the piano, but D natural in the vocal part - a kind of tonal/modal coexistence. And, unlike in Christianowitsch's transcriptions of Arab melodies (1863) with their four-part harmonies and contrary motion among the lines, Daniel's harmonic accompaniments are relatively static, restricted to short repeating patterns with few chords and often only two or three motivic elements¹⁵ For example:

This allows musical interest to go to the singer. If Daniel's transcriptions begin with piano introductions, their purpose is not to introduce the melody or even the mode. Rather, as in Arab music, Daniel's instrumental preludes serve to establish the rhythmic pattern underlying the piece and give some sense of the original timbres¹⁶. Accents in the piano help orient the western singer and encourage correct interpretation of the vocal rhythms, particularly valuable in the frequent alternations between two and three beats per measure (6/8 and an implied $\frac{3}{4}$)¹⁷. Mid-range rolled chords (in 'Ma Gazelle'), arpeggiated flourishes (in 'Klaa Beni Abbes', 'Yamina', and 'Chebbou-Chebban') or both (in 'Chant de la meule', Example 1) not only reinforce these accents, but also suggest the guitar, mandolin, or harp that may have accompanied the North African songs.

LE CHANT DE LA MEULE

Chant d'origine roumaine par l'artiste Daniel, d'après le chant roumain.

Al-lou, ma meule, tourne - tourne, le maître revient en
 air. re - vient en air. Me - reviens de ma qu'il a.
 Je - ra, ha! mon cœur est sans - pair! est sans - pair!
 Qu'il est grand, mais qu'il est ter - ri - ble, le maître que j'aime
 tant! Le dieu - tin est même in - de - si - ble, le si - même est même bré -
 diminuendo
 tant. Ah!

Ma meule, tour - ne
 re - vient, le maître revient en air. re - vient en air

In one of his most hybrid creations, for which only the manuscript survives, Daniel transcribed and arranged 'd'après l'originel' a Kabyle song for male chorus, flute (or oboe), tambourine, and tenor solo¹⁸, possibly conceived for the orphéon he directed in Algiers. Whereas in Algerian *nouba* a chorus would sing certain parts in unison, here, significantly, Daniel's chorus functions like the piano in his song transcriptions, that is, in a subservient role, while the melodic solo is shared between a tenor and a woodwind. The chorus provides a four-measure prelude with the words, 'Allons au rendez-vous', and the melody that will begin the work's six stanzas. Although in four-part harmony as if to announce the tonality of G major with its F# leading tone, its alternation of only two chords (I-V⁷-I-V⁷-I) resembles the short patterns characteristic of Daniel's other piano preludes (see endnote 15). Moreover, all the choral parts are extremely static, with each singer hovering on one to three notes. In contrast, the woodwind and tenor lines are lilting and rhythmically interesting. In the first stanza, the flute performs Daniel's transcription of the original melody, alternating duple and triple patterns and ending its phrases with a quick descending melisma as the text refers to the beloved as 'folle,' 'sorcière,' and 'font aimer.' In the second stanza, B, as the chorus repeats 'Allons au rendez-vous,' the tenor solo takes over the woodwind melody verbatim, adding its own text. The result is not only the simultaneity of two different musical styles, but also two texts. Sections A and B then repeat, but with a new text in the tenor part (B'). The form of the piece is thus:

Intro AB AB' A'B'

The last two stanzas are highly unusual in Daniel's oeuvre. The fifth stanza, section A', begins with the Arabic melody in the woodwind, however with grace notes, accents on off-beats, and melodic and rhythmic complexity, as a North African performer might add¹⁹. In the sixth stanza, the tenor solo repeats music from the first stanza, but with another text, the melisma falling on 'fidèle,' 'sorcière,' and, if the lover were to betray his beloved, she would 'font mourir.' The woodwind joins the tenor in his second half, doubling the melodic line, forcing them both to sing exactly the same pitches. A brief coda follows, with the chorus singing 'Allons au rendez-vous' as the woodwind recalls its opening phrase.

Such a song suggests that Salvador Daniel was attempting to create a way for western music, and indeed western musicians, to be supportive of African music (with the chorus accompanying the flute solo), to enter into a dialogue with it (in the alternation between A and B sections, with flute and tenor singing the same music), to respect the limits of western appropriation (with the flute alone performing the musical variants on the melody in A'), and finally to come into harmonious coexistence (with the flute and tenor

performing the same music at the end)-a kind of utopian political statement about mutual assimilation, albeit in a western context.

If such musical hybridity helped make this music accessible to sophisticated urban audiences, it also served a number of purposes, both musical and political. For both Tiersot and Salvador Daniel, transcriptions were a way to recapture a tradition deeply rooted in the distant past, to shed light on western music history. In his *Histoire de la musique* (1885), Félix Clément reproduces Daniel's Kabyle song 'Zohra' (without piano accompaniment) to suggest how, in a clear 6/8 and 'our minor mode', it was not that different from western music. Clément also includes another Kabyle song, 'Chant de la Meule', to show that the tritone, once 'banished from western music', is still used in North Africa (Example 1). In *Journal de musique* (1882), 'Chant de la meule' (this time *with* piano accompaniment) seems chosen for its vocal melismas. Here it appears before a similarly melismatic 'Chanson indienne' (from Lecocq's *Le Jour et la Nuit*) and a 'Chant de la Sulamit' (from Massenet's *Hérodiade*), transcribed for piano. Such examples would have allowed readers to compare how French composers treated melismatic music from different musical traditions.

Daniel's transcriptions also functioned as signs to contemporary North Africans, their tastes, and their culture, with political implications. In 1870, the socialist journal *La Science sociale* reproduced 'Chant de la Meule' for its socio-political undertones with which Salvador Daniel would have resonated. This Kabyle song - about a 'humble esclave et le maître puissant' between which there is 'un abîme infranchissable, l'abîme de la naissance' - begins in the Lydian mode, the 'effeminante mode' banished by Plato from the Republic, with syllabic declamation, one note per syllable. Here 'la femme condamnée aux travaux les plus pénibles', quasi-slavery, awaits her beloved husband for whom 'le destin est moins inflexible'. The reviewer sees 'la phrase musicale simple', 'en teintes grises et monotone', as expressing 'le dégoût d'un travail repugnant et toujours le même'. However, in the middle of the song, the music shifts to the Phrygian mode, the proud, warrior mode full of tritones, and syllabic text declamation gives way to the melismatic outpouring of pure music on 'ah'. The editor of *Science sociale* interpreted this momentary change as the 'femme revoltée', the slave who resists, although at the end she falls back into despair, returning to the Lydian mode and declamatory resignation²⁰. The Tunisian song, 'Le Ramier', also with both syllabic and melismatic text-setting and modulation in the middle, likewise appeared in the French press, albeit with a politically neutral text. Both the *Journal de musique* (January 1882) and *Le Figaro* (19 October 1881) reproduced it to draw attention to Tunisia during the conflict that led to it becoming a protectorate in May 1882.

Daniel's 'L'Ange du désert', a 'vieille chanson des Maures d'Espagne', is ironically the most western of all his transcriptions, even more than 'Marguerite', a villanelle based on a Maltese song. This song, to be played as a 'quasi valse', is full of changes in tempo and dynamics, expressive indications for the singer, and pedal markings for the pianist. After starting out as in his other transcriptions with two alternating chords, the piano functions as if in a duet with the voice rather than its accompaniment. The piano not only often doubles the vocal part, imposing western tuning on the singer, but also adds its own interludes (perhaps like an Arab violin might) and with each vocal repetition, adds its own variation, including a section with full triads - a kind of western musical development building to a climax.

Transcription in many ways resembles translation, subjective and driven by the skills, capacities, and values of the transcriber. While respecting and building on Salvador Daniel's work, numerous colleagues later took issue with Daniel's harmonizations, though without distinguishing between the style of 'L'Ange du désert' and that of his other songs. A reviewer in the *Journal asiatique* (1865) was not convinced by Daniel's attempt to fuse 'nos lois musicales' with those of North Africa (Meynard 1865:567). Tiersot felt the rhythms in Daniel's transcriptions 'parfois semblent rappeler Auber', the director of the Conservatoire during the Second Empire (Tiersot 1902:51). While he found 'Zohra' very charming, Loret objected to Daniel's choice of harmonies, 'trop modulantes et trop compliquées', and his bass rhythms lacking 'un peu de franchise et de fermeté' (Loret 1917:160). Rouanet, who later published his own transcriptions of North African music, harshly criticized Daniel for not being able to get beyond his European musical education, that is, for having 'traduit au lieu d'enregistrer' what he heard, as if humans can or should be like phonograph machines. Even though Daniel for the most part used chords 'appropriate to the scale of each mode', Rouanet found Daniel's chordal accompaniments 'torture' to his ears, removing 'toute leur originalité' (Daniel 1879:124 and Rouanet 1906 in Lavignac 1922:2913). In Daniel's defence, Henry Farmer pointed out that Daniel 'took the rough, unpolished song of the Arab and created a veritable work of art out of it'. Most of Daniel's songs with accompaniment, he thought, 'show how the Arab would have presented his song had he reached the harmonic stage'. Farmer concluded, 'whilst retaining all the genre of Arab physiognomy, Salvador, following their quaint melodic intervals, struck out in an entirely new path as original as anything Grieg or the new Russian school touched on' (Farmer n.d.:12, 13, 205, 209, 218-19, 248, 252, 254). As Rouanet likewise 'orchestrated' some of his own transcriptions, making 'un certain nombre de pièces destinés aux musiques militaires françaises et aux musiques civiles,' there is, therefore, some hypocrisy in his attack. Moreover, Rouanet

was proud that Arab musicians were impressed and moved by his orchestrations (Rouanet 1906:2913). This suggests that the project of collecting and transcribing North African music for Salvador Daniel and Rouanet was not just about archaeology or study of a tradition capable of shedding light on western musical traditions, but also the basis of musical hybridities with 'effets nouveaux' (Daniel 1879:163) that brought their creators admiration and respect.

Although both had the support of Jewish North Africans (Farmer n.d.:17-18)²¹, political differences may also have divided Daniel and Rouanet. Although Daniel also transcribed and composed works based on 'chansons mauresques' from Algiers and Tunis, his scholarship focused on Kabyle music, music performed by the rural, agricultural population of Algeria. He also spent his last years advocating for 'les chants du peuple', including the kind of urban popular song practiced by Mme Thérèse in Paris²². A radical communard in Paris, he was shot by French troops in 1871. Farmer explicitly connected Salvador Daniel's rebellious political views with his embrace of a music that rejected western harmony. His hybrid transcriptions were 'the aesthetic reflex of this revolt'²³. In contrast, Rouanet ignores Kabyle music in favour of urban music, particularly 'musique savante' that came to North Africa from the Spanish court. Rouanet sought to underline the Andalusian roots of contemporary African music, 'la glorieuse époque des khalifes de Grenade' (Rouanet 1906:2844). Daniel had not ignored this tradition in his music and his book²⁴. But Rouanet went much further, as if nostalgic for the time when music was part of 'des fêtes somptueuses' and 'l'instruction des élites'. The musical hybridity involved in western transcriptions of North African music, thus, was not without its troubling limitations as well as its suggestive possibilities, ranging the gamut musically as well as politically.

Hybridity in Saint-Saëns' Music

After Félicien David, whose use of an Arab melody in *Le Désert* (1844) brought him great fame, Camille Saint-Saëns was one of the most important French composers to incorporate Arab music and attempt to acclimatize African musical timbres. What interested him was not just assimilation, that is, how Arab music could infuse new vitality into western music, but also a kind of hybridity that implied coexistence. His *Suite Algérienne* was written as 'impressions' of a trip to Algeria in 1873 and premiered in 1881 when France was imposing a protectorate on Tunisia. To suggest the French military presence in Algiers, Saint-Saëns opens the four-part work with bugle-like horn patterns and ends with a bombastic, exuberant French military march. The second movement, 'Rhapsodie mauresque', incorporates Arabic-like melodies, possibly noted by the composer when he was there²⁵. At first

these melodies come in the woodwinds and percussion, instruments with cousins in North Africa; then they are echoed (and assimilated) by the string orchestra. After juxtaposing timbres, themes, and temperaments, the composer insistently superimposes two meters and two tonalities, the triple meter theme in A over the static duple meter accompaniment in D (Example 2). As Ralph Locke has pointed out, this ‘contrasting sequence of moods and meters’ resembles those of North-African *nouba* ensembles²⁶; it also suggests how Arab and western musical practices can coexist and even collaborate. **FIGURE B**

FIGURE B

The image displays two systems of musical notation for an orchestral score. The first system includes staves for Flute (Fl.), Trombone (Tromb.), Timpani (Timp.), and a section labeled 'Tambour de basque'. The second system includes staves for Horns and Clarinets (H^o et Cl.), Trombone (Tromb.), Timpani (Timp.), and a section labeled 'Tambour de basque'. The notation features complex rhythmic patterns, including triplets and sixteenth notes, and dynamic markings such as 'pizz.' (pizzicato) and 'Div.' (divisi). The score is written in a key signature of one flat and a time signature of 3/4.

Saint-Saëns also took on the problem of how to work with indigenous melodies as an artist. Whereas he might have added just 'une harmonisation régulière', which would imply that melody and accompaniment were 'indissolublement unis', it was more original, as one critic pointed out, to 'imaginer telle harmonie à quoi la mélodie garde l'air d'être en quelque sorte étrangère'. The composer excelled at creating, 'par mille ingénieux raffinements, cette amusante equivoque'. As if to foreground his western skills, in the 'Rhapsodie mauresque' the composer accompanied an Arab theme with itself moving in contrary direction in a way that recalls western counterpoint. Elsewhere overt modal differences between an Arab theme and its accompaniment give 'l'illusion d'une mélodie sans accompagnement'. Metric and tonal 'indécision' and 'incertitude', together with the 'compromis' underlying the 'suite rationnelle d'accords' (Quittard 1906:107, 111-113) is a kind of 'inbetween' or 'zone of intersection' that results in what Homi Bhabha's has called 'unresolved and unresolvable hybridity (Bhabha1994:4). It is also a metaphor for the uneasy and imbalanced cultural coexistence under colonialism.

With the policy of assimilation coming under attack in the 1890s and even Jules Ferry admitting its failures, Albert Girault reminded everyone that assimilation ideally could help unify the empire (Girault 1894:107, cited in Thobie 1991:299-302). Whether the composer, a staunch Republican, was sympathetic to this idea or not, in his *Africa* (1891), a fantasy for piano and orchestra, Saint-Saëns created another hybrid about coexistence, but this time focused on African cultural diversity. Again recalling Arabic *nouba* music, the work is a succession of themes but with different scales and moods, rather than, as in *nouba*, one scale linking the parts. Three aggressive, assertive, virile themes dominate, A, E, and G (Example 3 and Table 1). *Africa* opens with A, a tune Saint-Saëns heard in Biskra, a gateway to the Sahara desert settled by desert nomads in the middle ages and later a tourist destination. Most of the population is black, known for their warrior spirit, and the oboe-like instrument they used to perform. Biskra means instability, which is precisely the nature of *Africa's* opening theme. Turning round and round on the same pitches, its first downbeat lands on an augmented second melodically and harmonically and its syncopated rhythms avoid any regular beats. Moreover, the insistent accents on off-beats result in an aggressivity characteristic of Chauvi music. Later, after spinning a huge melisma out of this material, the composer 'acclimatizes' this theme, using it in a thoroughly western manner to modulate to another key and writes western counterpoint with it between the piano and other instruments. Rapid two-octave descents then accompany the ostinato rhythm of theme C, recalling war songs recorded

on wax cylinders in French Sudan. Towards the end, the composer cites a Tunisian melody he assumed was the Tunisian national hymn. While it does not begin in an aggressive manner, it helps drive the work to its final frenzy.



Africa also has lyrical and dance-like themes. In the middle, they function for the sake of contrast, as in military marches. Was Saint-Saëns referring to the difference between the desert and the cities, or vengeance and love, the two passions expressed in Arab music? While the fourth theme, D, is very dance-like and western, themes H and I are also dance-like, but seem African-inspired. This suggests that Saint-Saëns did not essentialize African music as merely virile, but also listened to and recognized its playful side. Another western lyrical theme, the second theme (B) - folk-like, marked *andantino espressivo*, and in E flat major-raises other questions about the work, not difference, but similarity. This melody resembles those of Brittany or Auvergne, the oldest parts of France. That scholars had often compared not only Auvergne to parts of Algeria, but also, in the distant past, their musics, suggests that this pastoral theme may also have been a way to signal such a connection²⁷. With its syncopations, augmented seconds, multiple themes, and frenetic ending in common, Saint-Saëns himself compared *Africa* to a 'Rapsodie hongroise', saying that maybe Hungarian gypsies had come originally from Africa²⁸. In a certain way, the comparison is appropriate. Saint-Saëns was a 'internal outsider', a foreigner in Africa, just as the gypsies were internal outsiders in Hungary (see also Locke 2009:136).

A third kind of theme in *Africa*, Theme F in parallel thirds, is specifically western although not specifically French. Thirds depend on the equal temperament of the piano to be harmonious. To the extent that the theme is playful and easy, providing moments of repose from the challenges of surrounding music, it points to the *moeurs* of the coastal cities. This theme thus adds another important dimension to *Africa*. It suggests that North Africa was also inhabited by a motley collection of westerners: Italians, Spanish, Maltese, and Greeks, naturalized in 1889. Was the composer both acknowledging the existence of this European diversity in African cities and supporting the idea of a 'new Mediterranean race' in the region? Inclusion of western music in *Africa* furthermore suggests that the process of assimilation should apply to the integration of Western as well as African elements of difference.

Music, along with trade and commerce, was central in the French project to create settler communities in Africa. Besides the theatre in Cairo, a theatre for opera opened in Algiers in 1853 and later in Oran, Constantine, Bone, Tunis, Tananarive, Tamatave, Casablanca, Rabat, and Dakar. The cities hired theatre directors, who annually travelled to Paris to form their troops. Meanwhile, settlers performed in their own orchestras and choral societies, and military bands played twice weekly for everyone's enjoyment in city parks. Saint-Saëns was part of this community, his music played relatively frequently in Algeria and streets eventually named after him. In 1892, Algiers put on his opera *Samson et Dalila* nine months before its premiere at the Paris Opéra. Performing and listening to Western music served an important political purpose: it provided French elites and other settlers of European descent with a sense of the culture they shared and an ongoing connection to the outside world.

Musical hybridity in *Africa* is thus complex in its signification. Saint-Saëns's appropriation of African tunes inevitably entailed removing one kind of meaning ascribed by African users - tradition and history - and replacing it with another, oriented to the Western listener. In this context, musical borrowing risked reducing varieties of difference to the category of difference, potentially collapsing into the binarism of Self-Other. This risk had other consequences as well. To the extent that new uses ignored the effects of displacement and disjunction on objects themselves and fixed the borrowed objects in new ways, their commodification could derail music's capacity to signify in meaningful ways. In other words, African music in such a context risked losing its Africanness.

Structure, however, is what makes *Africa* work - its subtitle, 'fantasy', referring to the chain-like unfolding of African-inspired tunes in dialogue with western ones (see Table 1). In section 1, the rondo-like alternation of an African-inspired theme (A, non-italic bold) and western themes (B and D, italic non-bold) underlines the distinction of theme A which here dominates

and frames the western melodies. In other words, we hear westernness differently when surrounded by Africanness. This is just the opposite in the *Suite Algérienne* where the ‘accents guerriers’ of French military music surround the ‘rythmes bizarres et les langoureuses mélodies orientales’ of the Arab-inspired middle movements, suggesting the dominance of France. Not that western music doesn’t have the last word in *Africa*. The western theme F too derives its power from the work’s structure. It both comes at the end of the second, third, and final sections and articulates the final tonality, G major, now purged of the augmented second with which the work began. But, I would argue, this is not just a conclusion. Theme F helps the music escape earlier binary oppositions, its rapid thirds leading the work toward pure sonority. At the end, western listeners could delight in the transcendent virtuosity of the pianist, while Arab audiences may have recognized the virtuose ‘tourbillon’ of traditional Arab *noubas*. Perhaps, as he began to live among them, this is how Saint-Saëns envisaged the challenge of coexistence under French rule in North Africa.

Hybrid Uses of Marches

Marches, the western musical genre most often heard in the colonies, were frequently used to express triumph and glory. For the western composer, this meant ‘colonizing’ as much of the musical space as possible with the same rhythms and theme, ‘conquering’ any elements that may threaten the dominance of the downbeat and the main tonality, and in the end returning victorious with the original material fortissimo and (if the original tonality was minor) in the relative major. Marches do this through their structure, the key to the enactment of their function. They are either ternary forms or rondos, like the refrain structures of the old ‘chansons militaires’. That is, military marches have a theme that returns, ABA. French orchestral marches often feature a series of contrasting ideas, ABACA (where each letter name represents an extended section of the music, as in *Africa*). Listening to the relationship between the returning material and the interrupting sections in these marches suggests how the power they may represent comes in part from the capacity of the A theme to contain difference. They suggest that the French thought of heroism as ever more apparent, dramatic, and triumphant when it follows, comes as the consequent to the softer, more relaxed, even feminine middle section.

In France, marches were a popular genre in which to submit exotic, modal melodies to western conventions of order and predictability. Although it does not suggest anything specifically French about the ‘West’, Saint-Saëns’ march *Orient et Occident* (1869) articulates a French ideology of Western superiority and progress, written before he went to Africa. Using an

ABA' form, the music coded as Occident (the use of strings and counterpoint in the A sections) serves as the framework for understanding, containing, and dominating the music coded as Orient (the predominance of percussion and static harmonies in the B section). In ways far more complex than the typical military march, however, Saint-Saëns does not merely juxtapose their differences, but instead deploys an arsenal of compositional and formal devices to make his point. The A section demonstrates that a Western theme can adapt to different contexts and endure change both from within as well as without. In the B section, as if to contain the slippery improvisational elasticity of real Oriental melody, Saint-Saëns squeezes the melismas into upbeats that emphasize the march's downbeats and he accompanies its main theme in fifths and tonal movement that brings the section into an unambiguous G major. In section A', the instruments associated with the B theme are forced to imitate the A theme. In the final minutes of the march, the rhythmic and timbral diversity disappears and the whole orchestra marches together, its simultaneous quarter notes triumphantly pounding out the E-flat major tonality. Saint-Saëns thereby posits the Orient as a stereotyped Other only to take it over, neutralize its difference, and assimilate it by virtue of Western skill. By the end of this march, the juxtaposition and binary opposition of East and West seem an illusion.

For Berlioz, such as in his *Marche hongroise* (1846), the march could also represent a story about the weak standing up to the strong. Its main theme is the Radoczy march, the national hymn of Hungary. Radoczy was the crown prince who tried to expel the Hapsburgs in the early 18th century. Although the Hungarian theme is light, playful, dance-like, and limited in its pitch materials, Berlioz shows it to be capable of real aggression, of standing up to loud brass interjections and ominous timpani, of melodic, rhythmic, harmonic, timbral, and registral expansion. By the end of the march, it has lost its simplicity and naiveté, exotic as it may have been, and proven itself masterful in many contexts. The idea of a national leader summoning the common people to help him push out a strong foreign aggressor undoubtedly had resonance among French listeners who may have identified with these Hungarians after their defeat to the Prussians in 1871.

In a colonial context, marches sometimes expressed the military's civil role as a symbol of the controlling order. One critic saw the final march in Saint-Saëns's *Suite Algérienne* as embodying 'la justice et les avantages de notre domination', perhaps referring to the disciplined coordination and coherent structure of the march's ABA form (Baumann 1905:299). Peace times also gave local military regiments and their bands the occasion to welcome visiting dignitaries and open formal ceremonies all over Africa. Some bands doubled as dance hall orchestras.

A little studied but important hybrid genre is music the zouaves, spahis, and other *tirailleurs indigènes* played on their own instruments (Figure 1) Did these musicians replicate sonneries performed by their French counterparts? If so, how did they adapt indigenous instruments to the timbres and tonalities of music for the clairon and the tambour? **Figure 1 - Le Petit Journal**



Military music expert Thierry Bouzard points out that these indigenous ensembles were conducted by French chefs de musique who also arranged the music they performed²⁹. Nonetheless, that some transcriptions of it resemble other indigenous music suggests that these conductors may have tried to replicate certain characteristics associated with African music. In Bénédictus's transcription of a *nouba* performed by Algerian *tirailleurs* during the 1889 Exhibition, for example, the right hand (RH) stays close to the theme (performed in unison by the *nouba*), while the left hand (LH) establishes a constant triplet rhythm using only four arpeggiated chords- reiterating

Salvador Daniel's manner of transcribing African songs, albeit less creatively (Bénédictus 1889:pp. 18-19). Tiersot furthermore noted that, even if *tirailleurs indigènes* wore European uniforms, moved with European gestures, and appeared 'civilisés', they had their own repertoire: 'airs nationaux, très vraisemblablement arrangés et rythmés pour la marche'. Eight to ten performers played the '*nouba* des turcos' in unison, supported by the percussion, including French cymbals. Like French marches, many of these pieces were in 6/8 and in a major scale; but like in Arab music, their music accelerated over time, ending very fast (Tiersot 1889:77-78). In his transcription of a 'March of the Algerian *nouba*', Tiersot tried to reproduce the repetitive quality of a tune they played 'at least twenty times in a row for five minutes' with four ideas, each recurring four times. If these piano versions cannot represent the sound and timbral variations of the original music and the march ends in C minor, at least both feature F# against E flat - an indexical sign of the Orient, but in Bénédictus functioning as a diminished seventh rather than an augmented second. As such, the transcriptions document African-inspired intervals in military music-hybridity where one might not expect it.

There were also hybrid uses of military marches by other Africans. For decades, the wind band of the Bey of Tunis performed its repertoire in unison on western instruments with its conductors, often European, who knew little about Arabic music³⁰. In his book, *Dance and Society in Eastern Africa* (1975), T.O. Ranger writes about how missionaries in Africa used European military music to introduce the freed slave children to 'the necessities of industrial time'. Marches stood in direct contrast to the 'inexplicable monotonies and sudden passions of African drumming; musical ability was taken as a sign, a promise of potential for civilization ... and the idea of drill and of uniform was intimately connected with the idea of learning civilization'.³¹

Ranger also argues that, while 'the dance was in some sense an adaptation to a new world dominated by European power' - the power of its culture as well as its arms - in some parts of East Africa colonized peoples **used** the brass band rather than merely adopted it in their struggle for both accommodation and self-pride. Dance associations called Beni developed in the 1890s; they enacted a form of music called *ngoma*, march-like music and dance based on the idea of military drill.

Sometimes the dance took the form of a parade, a procession, a march past; sometimes it took the form of a dance in platoon form; sometimes it took the form of a circling drill step. Singing was always an important part of Beni performances. Almost universally the language of Beni songs was Swahili and they normally took the form of simple rhyming commentaries on current affairs. Invariably the music and dance were merely one part of the activity of Beni members. The Beni *ngomas* had a hierarchy of male and female officers

with elaborate ranks, uniforms, and titles of honour.... the features of Beni-the sound of a brass band, the military drill, the hierarchies of officers with European titles-made it instantly recognizable wherever it went.... The mode was popular for a very long time and in very many places (Ranger 1975:5).

Amid the colonization process, Ranger explains, Africans used such music not only as a 'symbol of progress toward the desired new life', but also as a way of continuing their pre-colonial tradition of 'communal competition as expressed in dance, procession, and mimic combat' (ibid. 10, 15). In other words, marches were an attempt not only to absorb and master what was considered powerful in the life of their conquerors – a way of becoming 'modern' – they were a form of resistance, a way to reject the colonizers' emasculation, recast the expression of their own communal values, find new outlets for artistic innovation, and maintain their own pride and prestige among their peers.³² I hope to find other examples of western musical genres appropriated, transformed, and used by African musicians to suit their own purposes.

Hybridity after 1900: Ethnomusicologists' Search for the 'Pure' in North African Music

Along with relative consensus on the hybrid nature of the French people came ambivalence toward hybridity, especially in the colonies. Robert Young calls this 'an ambivalent axis of desire and aversion' (Young 1995 :19). By 1900 hybridity of all sorts was being used to fuel debates over whether France had become a 'grande dégénérée', or was merely suffering from 'une crise morale et sociale commune à toutes les nations modernes' (Fouillé 1895:793; Nordau 1894). Many came to agree with Paul Broca that if mixing closely related varieties can have advantages, among distantly related races it can threaten to erase the distinctions of difference (Broca 1864:16-18, 25-28). From Africa to Indochina, hybridity became a lightning rod for what was wrong with assimilationist colonial policy. Families were increasingly troubled by the impact of French education on their young, creating 'des êtres hybrides ... des déracinés', 'une génération hybride' who, 'baragouinant un français simiesque', felt themselves superior to their compatriots³³. This led to rethinking education throughout the empire, even music education³⁴, and to shifting colonial policy to the principle of association, or gaining cooperation and participation by native peoples in their own administration, education, and defence. With this change came indigenous participation in discussions at the Congrès de Marseille (1906); the founding of *La Revue indigène* (1906) and a new newspaper *Le Tunisien* (1907), both oriented to the concerns of indigenous peoples; and early independence movements among les Jeunes Tunisiens and les Jeunes Algériens. As *Le Courrier de Tunisie* put it (4 January 1907), France must 'renoncer à l'utopie de l'assimilation de la race arabe.'

As part of the new approach to their colonies, attention turned from exploiting cultural differences to acknowledging and wanting to preserve them. In the 1890s Gustave Le Bon, who had written on Arab civilization, popularized the idea that the soul of a race is reflected in its beliefs, traditions, and arts – ‘the inheritance of all its ancestors’-and that this soul is fixed and homogeneous, not alterable by education or intelligence(Le Bon 1894 and 1924:37, 126). As such polygenist racial attitudes began to take precedence over the monogenist search for universalism, the 1900 Congrès Colonial unanimously voted that native institutions and customs should be respected and maintained as much as possible. This idea found considerable resonance in the field of music. The 1900 Congrès de l’Histoire de la Musique called for using the phonograph to collect folk melodies in all countries. And whereas in 1889 Tiersot was preoccupied with what non-western music shared with western music, during the 1900 Paris Exhibition he was taken aback to find so much inauthentic hybridity -a Malgache musician playing a Spanish dance on an indigenous instrument that Tiersot himself had learned on the piano, and Italians dressed up and performing as Cambodian dancers, led by none other than the Opéra étoile, Cléo de Mérode. Consequently, he sought to focus on ‘l’étude des races les plus différentes des nôtres et les peuples les plus éloignés de nous: nous n’aurons donc pas à craindre de trouver leur musique contaminée par les influences européennes’ (Tiersot 1900:324). This preoccupation drew him to interviewing and writing about thirty Dahomean musicians.

Commentary about musical hybridity turned harsh in 1906. One critic noted that if a composer ‘voulut transposer dans sa musique ce qu’il avait entendu’abroad it was as if a colonialist who, gripped in a ‘fantaisie’ of ‘un Orient lointain’, sought themes to ‘plier sous ses lois et obliger à entrer dans la trame de ses compositions’ (Quittard 1906:107). Since attempts to incorporate Oriental melodies inevitably end up in distortion -an ‘insurmountable’ problem-in part because Oriental scales are ‘a priori inharmonisables’, he threw his hands up at the possibility of true assimilation: ‘Musique européenne, musique orientale, ce sont deux organismes distincts, souvent opposés, aussi loin l’un de l’autre en tous cas que les langues aryennes le sont des langues sémitiques’(ibid.:108-09, 116). After *Caprice Arabe (1894)* and his Piano Concerto no. 5 (1895), with its second movement incorporating a tune he heard rowers sing on the Nile, even Saint-Saëns changed his view. Until his death in Algiers in 1921, the composer continued to spend his winters in North Africa and, after hearing the Algerian tenor Bachetarzi sing, he was still interested in transcribing what he heard (Bachetarzi 1968)³⁵. However, he produced few additional musical hybrids incorporating African tunes.

Most musical compositions written by western settlers in Tunis and Algiers after 1900 remained thoroughly western -fantasies, romances, mazurkas, triumphal marches, and the occasional operetta-as if to assert settlers' connection to European traditions or express nostalgia for the metropole. Antonin Laffage, a composer, violinist, conductor, and music publisher born in Algiers, was among the few to compose and publish popular songs inspired by Tunisian tunes, albeit following western musical principles. For example, 'Khadoujah' (1902), a 'Rêverie traduite de l'Arabe,' has the RH of the piano doubling the voice, but the LH adding tonal harmonies and contrapuntal lines (Figure 2).

Figure 2



A recent blogger has called attention to the multiple levels of appropriation underlying 'Khadoujah' and takes issue with Laffage for publishing it under his name. One could also mention that, as its *éditeur*, he made money from its sale³⁶. When it came to publishing a 'Hymne beylicale,' based on another well-known tune, Laffage did not claim authorship (Example 4). The composer added a French text praising the Bey and harmonic accompaniment in the piano, but acknowledged himself only as the 'harmonizer.' A reviewer in the *Dépêche tunisienne* (23 March 1898) praised Laffage's adaptation in explicitly colonialist terms and suggested that, since some settlers may have had problems in listening to indigenous music, there was an audience for such hybridity among westerners:

Qui de nous n'a souffert de cette cacophonie, douloureuse pour nos oreilles civilisées, de ce tohu-bohu de notes heurtées, grinçantes, criardes, à travers lesquelles l'esprit se perdait en vain à la recherche d'une idée introuvable ou d'un rythme musical?

Grâce à M. Laffage, ce chaos s'est débrouillé; la lumière s'est faite. Par un véritable tour de force musical... le distingué professeur a fixé le rythme, l'a soutenu et mis en valeur par une harmonie des plus heureuses... 'L'Hymne beylicale' prend rang dans les œuvres que l'on peut écouter et applaudir; et ce ne sera pas la première fois que le génie français aura mis en lumière les œuvres à peine ébauchées par les civilisations rudimentaires. **Figure 3**

If this kind of hybridity pleased because it served to tame the rhythms and smooth out the harsh elements of the original, it also served an important political function, allowing westerners to 'listen to and applaud' indigenous traditions without having to encounter them in their 'rudimentary' forms.

Some continued to see a role for indigenous musicians in hybrid performances and performance groups, albeit in service of the colonizers. In 1906 the Résident Général of Tunis received a proposal of the French government instructing the creation of wind-bands made up of *tirailleurs indigènes* in all the African colonies. Members would be fitted with their own red and white uniforms and play not only simple military-band instruments – drums, brass, triangle, flutes- but also portable African instruments – a Senegalese balafon, Bambara drum, African flute and Malgache guitar. Arguing that such bands could invigorate French soldiers, lighten the fatigue of their marches, and entertain the population, the author pleaded for indulgence regarding the cacophony that such an ensemble might produce-undoubtedly not worse than municipal bands in many French villages (Bretagne 1906). There is no evidence that the project materialized.

général told French scholars their role should be ‘restoring the foundation, renewing the construction work, and on the foundation which you rebuild in good cement you are undeniably aiding us to build the marvellous future that we wish to make spring from this past’ (Lyautey 1921, cited in Wright 1991:79). As we will see, these ethnomusicologists shared respect for difference in their sources, increasing distaste for hybridity (whether European or other Arab influence on North African music), and an ideological bent with consequences.

On the simplest level, all continued to transcribe for the piano, rejecting the use of specialized notation to indicate microtones as proposed by Dom Parisot in 1898 (Parisot 1898 and Coulangettes 1904 and 1906). Each also rejected the addition of harmonic accompaniments and French texts, the hybridity previously thought necessary for western ears. When it came to Laffage’s twelve fascicles of *Musique arabe*, the pianist’s RH and LH only double the Tunisian melodies in octaves. There are no chords³⁷. In the separate volume Laffage published after his government-funded 1906 mission to Tripoli (Libya)³⁸, the Turkish charkis, military sonneries, popular and ceremonial music he collected also appear mostly without accompaniment. Arthur Pougin, writing in the music journal *Ménestrel*, concurred with this choice: ‘notre système occidental d’harmonie ne pouvant que leur enlever leur saveur et leur originalité’ (Pougin 1905:216). Rouanet’s critique of Salvador Daniel’s transcriptions that year echoed this. At the same time, Laffage specified that the melodies could be played by the western flute, clarinet, oboe, violin, or mandolin, with or without piano. That beginning with his fascicle 2 all French words- title names, collaborator names, song incipits, and even tempo indications- also appear in Arabic suggests that the public for these may have included the Arab population who could play western instruments, read western notation, and afford this luxurious publication with its watercolour images of Arab instruments and ornamental blue cover resembling a page out of the Koran (Figure 3). *Repertoire de la musique-*

Repertoire de musique arabe et maure (1904-23) was the fruit of a long collaboration between Yafil, the Jewish-Algerian musician who collected some of the tunes and published the volumes, and Rouanet, the French director of an Algerian music school who ‘directed’ his work, also collected tunes, transcribed them, and wrote introductory analyses³⁹. As with Salvador Daniel, the modes were crucial to Rouanet, the pieces possibly chosen to illustrate them. Like Laffage, Rouanet reduced the role of the accompaniment to doubling at the octave, albeit not always with the same rhythm. This unfortunately results in frequent dissonances caused by passing tones (such as in the accompaniment of Example 5). **Figure 5 Touchiat Remel Maya**



Also important, perhaps inspired by Salvador Daniel's use in his original transcriptions of Kabyle songs (Daniel 1879, nos. 3-5, 8, 10, 12-14). Rouanet added two separate staves below those of the piano to indicate the 'rhythmic accompaniment' of the original and explanatory notes for each transcription, practices Chottin and Erlanger later repeated. All titles either point to the mode and genre or are given in Arabic, as are the words for the vocal works in the collection, the French translations reproduced separately from the score. In the 1930s, attempts to reproduce performances more accurately led to additional innovations. Recognizing the importance of dance for the



Chleuh, Chottin added feet patterns and choreographic indications along with photos and notes on instrumental tunings. In his *Mémoires Tunisiennes* (1937), borrowing a notation developed by Philippe Stern at the Musée Guimet, Baron d'Erlanger added timbral indications (e.g. signs indicating guttural, intense, sombre, brilliant, vibrating, closed mouth, etc.).

Documenting what they found, these transcriptions include a range of genres, from serious to light, old to contemporary, classical to popular, 'hispano' to 'nègre,' although not without communicating a sense of hierarchy among them. Significantly, the ethnomusicologists proposed categories to classify their knowledge, categories heavily influenced by binary oppositions dominating discourse in the metropole: urban and rural, serious and popular, private and public, *les élites* and *le peuple*, as if distinct entities. Laffage, who eschewed categorization, included some popular music, but ignored

distinctions pointed out by later scholars: that Tunisian music was largely performed by ‘dilettantes musulmanes et professionnels israélites’, the first devoted to ‘la musique arabo-andalouse’ and the second to ‘chanson populaire’⁴⁰. Rouanet, working in Algeria, concentrated on binary divisions within urban music, which he also categorized as either ‘musique andalouse’ or ‘populaire’ and performed by men or women. Perhaps in response to Lyautey’s need to see urban Arabs and rural Berbers as distinct in his strategy to divide and conquer Morocco (Irboh 2001), Chottin insisted instead on the stark divisions between urban and rural music, the result of ‘deux civilisations’. After identifying a ‘rhythmic phase’ of music (rural Berber) and a ‘melodic phase’ (urban Andalusian), Chottin devoted his first volume of *Corpus de la musique marocaine* to Andalusian music-performed indoors, in private, and by highly trained musicians - and his second to Chleuh Berber music-older, more varied, performed outdoors, in public, and accompanied by dance⁴¹. Later, like Rouanet, he too found it necessary to examine urban music in two categories, classical and popular music⁴².

Erlanger presented his collection of Tunisian melodies based on purported age. While Laffage included one example of ‘musique des nègres’ in his Tripoli volume, Erlanger’s *Mémoires tunisiennes* begins with a ‘chant nègre’ performed by Nigerian Haoussas, as if an example of Tunisia’s most primitive music, although with two parts in counterpoint. Then come four examples of ‘musique arabo-berbère’, four from the ‘tradition andalouse’, music by various confréries, and finally an ‘air tripolitein’. Harking back to Salvador Daniel, he even claimed that one of his ‘arabo-berbère’ melodies came from the troubadour tradition. Erlanger’s categories thus suggest not only certain racial stereotypes but also a concept of musical evolution. At the same time, Erlanger acknowledges the diverse geographical origins and religious associations of music in contemporary Tunisia.

Largely left out of these categories except as a form of urban popular music, the most problematic music these ethnomusicologists encountered resulted from mixing, which Prosper Ricard called ‘brassage’ (Ricard n.d.).⁴³ Laffage’s Tripoli collection includes Egyptian, Syrian, and mostly Turkish music. But performances he heard by Turkish military bands, conducted by an Italian, were dominated by Italian music. Although France had given Italy the right to pursue its interests in Tripoli since 1902 in return for France’s free hand in Morocco, Laffage bemoaned, ‘Dans tous les pays de l’Orient, [la musique] s’italianise, et les principaux hymnes, le turc, le tunisien, l’égyptien, et d’autres hymnes encore ont été écrits par des compositeurs italiens’. Whether expressing patriotic envy or sympathy towards the Turks, Laffage could point to performer indifference towards Italian music and the

very small public for it. Yet, although he suggested that it would be better to 'renoncer à toutes participations ou introductions, si effacées soient-elles, de la musique européenne', Laffage composed his own march for the 57th Turkish Infantry, dedicated to the Redjeb-Pacha. Other Tunisians, however, were more receptive to external influences, including the Conseil municipal of Tunis, perhaps because of its Arab members and president Mohamed Sadok Ghileb. In 1907-08, pushed by a socialist journalist from Oran and in hopes of stimulating the creation of local Arab theatre, they invited the first Egyptian theatrical group to perform in Tunis⁴⁴.

In Algeria, Rouanet was much more anxious about hybridity, his attitudes echoing the contemporary preoccupation throughout the French empire with epidemics and contagion. In his three small collections of *zendani*, popular songs from Algiers (nos. 15, 18, 21), Rouanet bemoans European influence on this genre which he places 'dans la catégorie la plus inférieure du répertoire'. If *zendani* were scorned by male artists who played their *noubas* in private, if they 'courent les rues', and were performed by women, children, and 'la multiplicité des interprètes maladroits', they were also susceptible to all kinds of 'altérations provenant des contacts européens'⁴⁵. Still, Rouanet argued that these short melodies deserved to be protected from 'les déformations que ne tarderaient pas à leur imposer la pénétration de la musique européenne', as if the more they became Europeanized, the more these influences would take root in the culture and might contaminate Arab classical music. When one looks closer in his *recueils*, however, one finds not European-influenced genres, but music from the rest of the Arabic world. Included are a 'zendani moderne' (a satirical song of Algerian Jews), a Spanish melody, and an Egyptian dance. Salvador Daniel had noted how quickly African melodies themselves could change in migrating from Tunisia to Algeria, but Rouanet was more distressed about the increasing 'goût du chromatisme' infiltrating from Turkey, 'amolissant la rudesse primitive'⁴⁶ of Algerian music. In other words, it was important to protect Algerian music from any kind of hybridity.

Twenty years later in Morocco, A. Gastoué pointed out that, 'les Marocains musiciens les plus appréciés remplacent [le 3/4 de ton] sans scrupule par la touche la plus voisine du piano ou de l'harmonium' (Gastoué 1931). But in his *Corpus*, vol. 2, Chottin transcribed three 'adaptations d'airs européens' recorded for Odéon that tell another story (Example 6). Adaptation d'airs européens

B. - ADAPTATIONS D'AIRES EUROPÉENNES

DANSE N° 22 (mode aélhki)
♩ = 116
Talous et rebab

DANSE N° 23 (même mode)
♩ = 120
La batterie et les talous suivent le rythme du chant

DANSE N° 24 (même mode)
♩ = 120
La batterie et talous...

Fascinating examples of musical hybridity from the native perspective, these recordings, based on 'sonneries', suggest that 'European music' meant not just waltzes and mazurkas, but also western military music. Believing that they show 'à quelle point l'éducation antérieure de l'oreille peut, chez les primitifs, devenir exclusive des formes nouvelles', Chottin interpreted them pejoratively: 'Cette imitation d'une sonnerie de clairon entendue par Sasbo à Casablanca montre bien comment l'adaptateur accomode à son oreille les intervalles de quarte juste, de tierce mineure, et de sixte majeure, qui heurtent sans doute trop fort ses habitudes'. In translating this music for the rebab, he pointed to Sasbo's errors in aural judgement: 'la quarte du clairon, sol do, est devenue la quinte fa-do', 'la tierce majeure do-mi a compensé l'allongement de la tessitura en devenant mineure, do-mi bémol; la sixte majeure du clairon, devant enfin une septième mineure, fa-mi bémol'. His conclusion shows

little sympathy for the endeavour: 'Quoique l'intention de l'adaptateur ait été de reproduire fidèlement ce qu'il entendait, l'allure nouvelle de cette sonnerie, ainsi transposée, n'en est pas moins caricaturale pour nous (emphasis mine) (Chottin 1933). Ironically, these observations could have been made by Africans about westerners' perceptual limitations and about their adaptations of African music for western instruments.

What bothered Ricard more than the easy seductions of European music were the 'd'innombrables airs étrangers' introduced into Morocco from the rest of the Arab world by phonograph recordings, especially the 'Oriental' tunes by 'turcs, Egyptiens, tunisiens, et algériens, la plupart empreinte d'un modernisme assez vulgaire mais aussi séduisant aux Marocains' (Ricard n.d.). While ethnomusicologists were stepping up efforts to notate and preserve indigenous music on wax cylinder recordings⁴⁷, Gramophone and Pathé were flooding local markets with commercial recordings of 'des airs bruyants ou curieux, même vulgaires' that put these traditions into jeopardy⁴⁸. In Europe too, folklorists worried about 'l'altération d'un répertoire archaïque par une infiltration urbaine ou suburbaine, la perte d'un caractère dialectal d'un style régional avec le contact avec le style d'une autre région', et 'la naissance de types mélodiques hybrides par assimilation rapide de la musique artistique' heard on recordings (Brailoiu 1931:234). Like Rouanet, the hybridity Ricard saw with the most potential to lead Moroccans to 'négliger ou travestir leur musique propre, même à leur fausser le goût' (Ricard n.d.) was that which might result from 'mélange' with music from other parts of the Arab world, significant enough for him to consider it a third category of Moroccan music.

With 'le patrimoine local grandement menacé' by hybridity (ibid.), the French had a pretext for getting involved, as if African traditions needed French protection. For Rouanet, Yafil, Chottin, and Erlanger, what was important was not just notating indigenous melodies 'avec la plus rigoureuse exactitude' et 'un scrupule formel de ne rien changer aux mélodies exécutées devant nous et de les noter sans la plus petite modification'⁴⁹. It was finding 'les mélodies et les rythmes avant qu'ils ne s'altèrent au contact d'influences étrangères' (Chottin 1928:16). Like in France where the notes of a folksong were understood, especially by Ancien Régime sympathizers, as the remnants of resistance to outside influences and the impact of urban civilization-pointing to a time before layers of assimilation and hybridization -this meant the oldest music they could find. Just as those seeking to understand French racial origins looked in their mountains for the 'pure and most complete' version of certain French *chansons populaires*⁵⁰, these collectors sought to find, fix, and reproduce 'des mélodies typiques de leur race et de leur religion'⁵¹ that could serve as models for African musicians in the future.

From this perspective, Rouanet, Yafil, Chottin, and Erlanger concurred in the need to collect, first and foremost, music the medieval Moors brought from Andalusia, Spain. They referred to it as ‘musique arabe ancienne’, ‘musique arabe classique’, and ‘une musique officielle, faite pour les cours et les palais’, introduced by Spanish émigrés from the ‘intellectual class’ (Rouanet 1904 and 1906:128, Ricard n.d., Erlanger 1917:67, Chottin 1928). This music expressed values the French wished to support: ‘le respect quasi-religieux de la tradition, la soumission aux règles reçues des anciens, la défiance à l’égard de toute innovation⁵². French ethnomusicologists hoped not only to produce ‘une sorte de compendium d’une musique restée immuable depuis le VII^e siècle,’ but also to ‘sauver d’un oubli définitif les traditions d’art qui avaient créé tant de chefs d’œuvres’⁵³.

The genre, its repertoire, and its future were perceived at risk for a number of reasons. Few musicians knew Arab classical music, which had been constantly ‘menacé par l’assimilation et le progrès’ (Rouanet 1905:327). Some musicians even confused one mode for another. Old masters had not wanted to write down their music or share their knowledge with the young, perhaps because not wanting ‘profanation par les infidèles’. While popular genres were thriving in North Africa, the classical tradition was dying out for lack of a new generation of practitioners. Whether this was reminiscent of France’s depopulation problems or traditions threatened with extinction at the end of French monarchy, French administrations understood it as a call for action.

What was to be done? Ethnomusicologists first sought out the finest musicians available, sometimes identified by their peers, especially those whose respect for tradition was such that they would be ‘incapable d’y changer une seule note’⁵⁴. At least some of their sources were acknowledged- for Rouanet, Yafil’s teacher, M. Sfindja ‘qui lui seul sonnait 1,000 mélodies, paroles et musique’⁵⁵ and Yafil’s Jewish collaborator, Laho Seror; for Chottin, the help of Si Omar Jaidi for Vol. 1 and Rais Mohammed Sasbou, director of the Chleuh troop, for Vol. 2. Then they sought to notate not the improvisatory creativity of individual artists, but the ‘racine [el-asl] du chant’, ‘la mélodie fondamentale dépouillée de ses ornements les plus souvent parasites’⁵⁶. If the notion of fixing these melodies might seem antithetical to the oral tradition and Arab performance practice, in their defence both Rouanet and Chottin pointed out that the oral tradition itself has ‘oublis’, ‘altérations’ and ‘immanquables défaillances’⁵⁷. Whether their informants were responding to what they were asked or helping to shape their questioners’ perspectives and conclusions, we will never know. But what is clear is that, just like ‘pure high Javanese culture’ was the product of the ‘joint efforts of Dutch Javanologists and conservative native elites’ (Florida 1995 in Cooper and Stoler 1997:9), the collection, transcription, and preservation of ‘les seules

vestiges' of the 'grandeur artistique' of the Muslim people⁵⁸ involved both French music scholars and conservative masters of the classical tradition who shared belief in the importance of this repertoire.

The history of what followed is well known. These scores were marketed and sold all over Europe and indigenous musicians got increasingly involved in transcription projects, sometimes making similar compromises⁵⁹. Yafil went on to train the famous tenor Bachetarzi, form an ensemble of indigenous musicians, El Moutribia, and bring his group to Paris to perform and record this music in the 1920s (for other similar stories see Miliani 2008:91-99). Arab music schools were started, often with French backing. In 1932, Ricard, director of the Service des Arts Indigènes who directed Chottin's work, claimed not only that the 'prospérité' of such artistic groups was 'une conséquence de notre présence au Maroc', but also that the French had contributed 'dans une large mesure, au développement de l' Art musical Chleuh et de ses ressources' Ricard n.d.). Moreover, by 1939, French vanity and ambitions went so far that Chottin felt they could determine what the future would need from the past: 'nous tenterons de prévoir quelle pourrait être l'évolution future de cet art et dans quel sens doit s'exercer l'action officielle en vue de sauvegarder ses caractères distinctifs et sa valeur culturelle' (Chottin 1939:54). That some master musicians may have conceived the Arab classical tradition differently or thrived, built a following, and performed widely in North Africa without any contact with the French was not part of their story.

Conclusion

Musical hybridity, at best, was a forum for encountering the Other, a space for examining and pushing on the boundaries between European and African musical cultures, for settler and indigenous cultural creativity. But, as I have suggested, far more was at stake in the colonial context. If hybridity before 1900 may have expressed curiosity, an imagination of coexistence, or the utopia of assimilation, all from the French perspective, the shift in colonial policy from assimilation to association and early independence movements after 1900 brought anxiety. Musical hybridity became a highly contentious and politicized genre. Even though westerners had been an integral part of North Africa since the Christians arrived and, with colonization, settlers built theatres that natives eventually attended and concert organizations in which they participated, and if it would have been difficult for locals to escape hearing western music in city parks and on July 14 festivities, the notion of indigenous music changing as a result of contact with outside influences was troubling. The collection, notation, and preservation of local music was meant not only to document racial distinctions- European vs. African, Arab vs. Berber-but also to stem the spread of modernity. From Salvador Daniel

to Chottin and Erlanger, these ethnomusicologists may have contributed to local pride, but they also reinforced, or arguably helped construct, musical identities that were firmly linked to the distant past, not the modern present. Unable to inhibit the flow of change stimulated by widely available recordings, they used the gravitas of their projects to deny the kind of progress brought by these new media, except when their use reinforced French agendas.

Although never explicitly articulated, two political goals, I would argue, drove both the 20th-century resistance to musical hybridity in the French colonies and the focus on locating and transcribing indigenous music, going well beyond the 19th-century preoccupation with studying music for what one could learn about racial categories and intercultural contact. The French needed to forge traditions that would unify their colonies both from **without** and from **within**. To the extent that Andalusian emigrants settled all over North Africa, their *musique savante*, still practiced in urban centres from Morocco to Tunisia, was not only a high art tradition. It was also one that reminded North Africans of what they shared, even if it took different local forms- Rouanet points out, for example, that indigenous musicians in Tlemcen played ‘touchiat inconnues à Alger’⁶⁰. It is perhaps no coincidence that Rouanet and Yafil began their project to collect and preserve Andalusian music during the French attempt to take over Morocco- between the secret agreements with Spain and Britain in 1904, the Moroccan ethnic rebellions of 1907 that led to French occupation and the Treaty of Fez in 1912. If Andalusian music offered a way to conceive of North Africa as a unified region, it was important to include Morocco, ‘où les traditions andalouses sont plus vivaces et ont semé des racines plus profondes’ than in Algeria (Rouanet 1906:2845). Although their transcriptions included a wider range of traditions, some arguably older, ethnomusicologists also perhaps valued this tradition because of its association with elites, elites from Spain and later Jewish and African elites, including the Sultan’s court in Morocco. Chottin admitted that his master informer, Si Omar J’Aidi, was the personal musician of the Sultan⁶¹. Was the ethnomusicology part of currying favour with them, or helping to form new elites, connected, if not also indebted, to the French?

With the African empire solidified by the 1930s, the continued anxiety toward hybridity can be explained, perhaps, as a response to the political need for unity **within** the various colony/protectorates, the continent previously characterized by fluid identities. To emphasize that Chleuh Berbers lived all over Morocco - implying that their music could serve as a unifying factor within rural Morocco - Ricard reproduced the touring schedule of a Chleuh ensemble that in 31 months performed in 26 Moroccan towns and villages (1928-1931)⁶². Unlike urban *musique savante*, the point was not that rural *musique populaire* was fixed, but rather that it expressed a shared, ongoing

taste and could assimilate and be assimilated throughout the country, as Tiersot had shown for *chansons populaires* in France⁶³. With Volume 2 of his *Corpus*, Chottin intended to represent not ‘un monument traditionnel immuable, mais un moment particulier dans la production incessante de l’art musical Chleuh’ (Chottin 1933:25).

All the musicians discussed here were supported by the French government. That Andalusian and Berber musical traditions, far more than any others, were so valorised that a distinguished French aristocrat, the Baron d’Erlanger, in Tunisia and a branch of the Direction générale de l’Instruction publique, des beaux-arts, et des antiquités in Morocco both commissioned and funded its transcription into western notation must have sent a signal to local musicians: what interested those with money and power were ‘pure’ traditions, not hybrids ‘contaminated’ by outside influences. Ethnomusicologists and their collaborators began a process that contemporary African scholars, musicians, and their promoters have continued to build on⁶⁴. If there has been little deconstruction of the mythologies and their meaning, perhaps it is for similar reasons of regional and internal identity. In the post-colonial world, equally popular experiments in hybridity, like Afropop, may be again blurring identities, particularly between classical and popular, ‘North’ and ‘South.’ This music too has a substantial following and made substantial contributions to local pride and emerging economies in North Africa.

Table 1.

Thematic Structure in *Africa*

A pf A' pf B A' pf c D D' pf A

E E E' pf F

A

G G B' H G' H I F G

pf G G E F' pf

A

Example 1: Salvador Daniel, 'Chant de la Meule,' as reproduced in Félix Clément, *Histoire de la musique* (1885)

Example 2: Rapsodie mauresque, *Suite algérienne*

Example 3: Musical theme A in Saint-Saëns, *Africa*

Example 4: Laffage, 'Hymne beylicale'

Example 5: 'Touchiat Remel Maia' from Rouanet and Yafil, *Répertoire de musique arabe et maure*

Example 6. Chottin, *Corpus de la musique marocaine*, Vol. 2

Figure 1. The nouba of Algerian tirailleurs, on the cover of *Le petit parisien* (20 July 1913)

Figure 2: Laffage, 'Khadoujah'

Figure 3: Laffage, *Musique Arabe*

Notes

1. In his *Histoire générale de la musique depuis les temps les plus anciens jusqu'à nos jours*, 1 (Paris: Firmin Didot, 1869), i1 and 11, F-J. Fétis claimed that hearing the music of a people makes it easy to judge their intelligence as well as their morals, passions, and other dispositions.
2. E.g. La Société philharmonique arabe de Sousse, fd. 1900.
3. In his 'The Postcolonial and the Postmodern,' in *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), Homi K. Bhabha notes, 'The transnational dimension of cultural transformation – migration, diaspora, displacement, relocation - makes the process of cultural translation a complex form of signification. The natural[ised], unifying discourse of 'nation,' 'peoples,' or authentic 'folk' tradition, those embedded myths of culture's particularity, cannot be readily referenced. The great, though unsettling, advantage of this position is that it makes you increasingly aware of the construction of culture and the invention of tradition' (p. 172).
4. Similarly, in *La Musique et les musiciens français* (Paris: Delagrave, 1895) Albert Lavignac defines the beautiful in music as 'residing in the felicitous harmony of proportions' (p. 441).
5. European descendants in Algeria became naturalized French in 1889. See Faidherbe and Topinard, 'Instructions sur l' Anthropologie de l' Algérie,' *Bulletin de la Société de l'Anthropologie de Paris*, 8 (1873), pp. 603-659, discussed in Patricia M.E. Lorcin, *Imperial Identities; Stereotyping, Prejudice, and Race in Colonial Algeria* (London: Tauris, 1995), pp. 157, 196-197, 202, 209-210. In *De la Colonisation*, Leroy-Beaulieu also mentions other Europeans in Algeria as 'useful auxiliaries' and those most capable of assimilating with the French (pp. 330-31, 336).
6. In his *Colonialist Desire. Hybridity in Theory, Culture, and Race* (New York: Routledge, 1995), Robert Young notes that this was the 'dominant view from the 1850s to the 1930s' (p. 18).
7. Because such discourses can also be 'driving forces in history, and not merely representations,' as Tzvetan Todorov argues in *On Human Diversity: Nationalism, Racism, and Exoticism in French Thought*, trans. Catherine Porter (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), xiii, these concerns had larger implications which music helped to illuminate. See Pasler, 'Theorizing Race' and 'The Utility of Musical

- Instruments in the Racial and Colonial Agendas of Late Nineteenth-Century France,' *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* Vol. 129, No. 1 (Spring 2004): 24-7.
8. Daniel, F.S., 1879: 4. In this, he disagreed with G. A. Villoteau who, in his *De l'état actuel de l'art musical en Egypte* (Paris: Imp. Impériale, 1812), attributed 'les petits intervalles' in Arab music to a 'corruption ou décadence' of ancient Greek music. Weckerkin, in 'Lecture sur la Musique des Arabes,' (26 March 1864), *Bulletins de la Société des Compositeurs de musique* (1864) and Farmer, in 'Notes on Arab Music' in *The Music and Musical Instruments of the Arabs*, 204-05, concurred that Villoteau may have been confused by the nasal style of Arabic singing and performances in which singers glided from one note to the next.
 9. Farmer's 'Memoir,' in *The Music and Musical Instruments of the Arabs* (19, 22), discusses Daniel's views about 'la musique sociale' and his music criticism in leftist newspapers, *La Marseillaise* beginning in 1869 and *L'Homme* in 1870-71.
 10. Daniel, *Musique arabe*, 58. Daniel had personal reasons to empathize with resistance. According to Henry Farmer in 'Memoir,' Daniel's father, a nobleman, 'had his property and estates confiscated' for 'supporting the Carlist rebellion of 1830,' after which he fled to France.
 11. Daniel, *Musique arabe*, page before the title. In his 'Memoir,' Farmer notes that the Comte sent Daniel 1000 francs (p. 10).
 12. See 'Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique', Salvador Daniel's lecture to the Société des Compositeurs in Paris on 39 May 1868, published in *Bulletins de la Société des Compositeurs de musique* (1868): pp. 141-156, especially 155; Paul Lacome, 'Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique d'après Salvador Daniel', *Revue et gazette musicale* (14 November 1880): p. 363, and Lacome, 'Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique d'après Salvador Daniel,' *Revue et gazette musicale* (5 December 1880): p. 387. In 'Notice sur la musique Kabyle,' appended to *La Musique arabe*, Daniel also refers to a mode in Kabyle music that resembled the Greek Lydian without its second note (pp. 161-62).
 13. For example, in his *Corpus*, vol. 1, Chottin notes that the correct pitch was between B flat and B natural, but that his informant preferred for him to indicate B flat (p. 6).
 14. The exception being the Andalusian song, 'L'Ange du désert.' Cf. *chansons populaires* reproduced and discussed in my 'Race and Nation.'
 15. For example:
 - in 'Yamina' G major- D⁷ chords repeat five time before variation;
 - in 'Zohra' the same four-measure pattern centering on E minor repeats three times before a variant;
 - in 'Ma Gazelle' the harmony remains static on A major five of every six measures; and
 - in 'Klaa Beni Abbes' the accompaniment consists of G major arpeggios alternating with D⁷ chords.
 16. In 'Notice sur la musique Kabyle,' Daniel notes that the piano accompaniment in his *Album de chansons arabes, mauresques, et kabyles* (Paris: Richault, s.d.) 'reproduit le rythme des tambours' (p. 163).
 17. At the end of 'Cancion morisca,' the first North African song (from Tunis) he published in Spain (1858), Daniel explained that to reproduce Arab rhythms, the pianist should emphasize the sforzando accents, creating a rhythmic effect of 3+ 3+ 2.

18. Ms. 1730, Département de musique, Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris. Daniel considered the flute and the tambour the basics of the Arab popular orchestra (*Musique Arabe*, p. 68).
19. This song is unusual in its written-out variants of the Arabic original melody. Daniel published most of his songs as if strophic, that is, assuming identical music for each stanza and ignoring ornamental variants that would have characterized performances.
20. V. Faneau, 'Le Chant de la meule,' *La Science sociale* (1870): p. 63. He concludes, 'Nul espoir pour vous, esclaves en Barbarie, et salariés en civilisation....'
21. Yafil was Rouanet's collaborator.
22. See above and Salvador Daniel, *A propos de chansons: Le Personnage régnant. Première lettre à Mlle Thérèse de l'Alcazar* (Paris: Noirot, 1867) and *A propos de chansons: La Complainte de l'ogre. Deuxième lettre à Mlle Thérèse de l'Alcazar* (Paris: Noirot, 1867).
23. Farmer, *Memoir*, 20-21. It would be fascinating to examine how Salvador Daniel treated Arab tunes and modes in his other music; how in his symphonic suite of Arab dances he negotiated his intense interest in the sound of North African music with the means available to a western orchestra; how in his four *Fantasies arabes* for piano his use of theme and variations may have been influenced by Arabic models; and what his opera would have sounded like - all works mentioned by Farmer but apparently lost.
24. Daniel, whose father was a Spanish organist and composer, had visited Spain, knew its music, and included two Spanish songs on his concert at the Salle Herz in Paris on 14 March 1864. Daniel, *Musique arabe*, 5, 13, 28, 163 and Farmer, 'Memoir,' p. 11.
25. Unfortunately any transcriptions Saint-Saëns made in Algeria are apparently lost.
26. Ralph Locke considers the 'Rhapsodie mauresque' the 'most artistically successful evocation' of 'non-Western music-making before Colin McPhee's gamelan-inspired *Tabuh-Tabuhan* (1936).' See his 'Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East,' *19th-Century Music* (summer 1998): p. 41.
27. From Villoteau to Tiersot, ethnographers had long underlined these similarities, some assuming that French songs had been brought to North Africa by French sailors.
28. Saint-Saëns letter to Jacques Durand (23 March 1891), Bibliothèque Mahler, Paris.
29. Private conversation.
30. In his 'Au sujet de la musique arabe,' *Revue tunisienne* (1917), Baron d'Erlanger disparaged this music, calling it 'une musique bâtarde qui n'a pas le caractère d'une science et non plus le charme d'un art' (pp. 91-95).
31. I am grateful to Richard Roberts (Department of History, Stanford University) for directing me to this valuable study.
32. Ironically perhaps, Ranger notes that some of these tunes were so much in the European military band tradition that they were later adopted by the bands of German and British armies. *Ibid.* p. 43. This idea of performing the marches of one's conqueror to absorb what was powerful in them was also practiced in Paris. Nothing symbolized German musical might, its vitality and virility, more than Wagner. Until his operas were produced in France, most of what the French heard by Wagner was done in orchestral concerts. Marches from *Tannhäuser* and *Lohengrin* were among the most popular excerpts.

33. See for example, *La Dépêche Tunisienne* (1 October 1900) and Georges Froment 'La Politique indigène en Indochine', *La Revue indigène* (March 1906): p. 57.
34. Erlanger, in 'Au sujet de la musique arabe', suggested that since Arabs 'ne goûteront jamais' western music, Arab students should be encouraged to study with Arab masters, not western music teachers (p. 95).
35. I am grateful to Anissa Bouayed for bringing my attention to this anecdote.
36. A recent internet blog by a Monsieur Choc, at <http://esmma4.pagesperso-orange.fr/kem0805.htm>, accessed on 6 November 2010, suggests that not only was 'Khadoujah' based on a song of the same name written by an officer of the Chasseurs d'Afrique, Captain Vallabrègue, probably in the caserne Marguerite or a café of the Champ-de-Manoeuvres in Mustapha around 1900; it was also a well-known Arabic air, thanks to its use in a quadrille written by a Zouave who apparently only knew Arabic tunes. Indeed there is a song at the Musée de l'Armée, Paris, with this name and the same text (thanks to Thierry Bouzard for providing me with a copy). But not only is the tonality and accompaniment different, especially with the descending chromatic line in Laffage's introduction, but also the arabesque of Laffage's melodic line, as if a variant that evolved over the years. Moreover, the structure, of Valabregue's song is AABA' A, that of Laffage's song, ABABCC.
37. It is possible that this decision was inspired by transcriptions made by indigenous arrangers, such as Bouaziz whose transcription for piano of 'Mélodie arabe' (Algiers, 1902) opens with a free introduction, but for the 'mélodie,' uses octaves doubling the RH in the LH accompaniment.
38. Letter from the Gouverneur général to the Gérant du Consulat général in Tripoli (21 July 1906), and letters from Laffage to the Résident général de la Tunisie (23 June 1906), (3 January 1908), Archives diplomatiques à Nantes. Laffage's Tripoli volume was recently translated into Arabic and annotated by Mohamed Garfi: *Al-mûsîqâ al-çarabiyya—: âlâtuhâ wa u!niyâtuhâ / ta%lîf Anmûnân Laffâç ; tarçama—, çar% wa taçlîq Mu%ammad al-Qarfî* (Beyrouth: Dar wa Maktabat Al-Hilal, 2006). The introduction unfairly assumes that Laffage's work was intended to 's'en servir dans ses propres compositions et d'en fournir aux musiciens européens en quête de couleurs exotiques.'
39. Laffage suggested in a letter to the Résident Général that his cohort in Algeria (probably Rouanet) had received government funding for his 'restauration de la musique mahométane.' See endnote 14.
40. Garfi, *Musique et spectacle*, p. 97. I have here deleted the demeaning manner in which Garfi presents Jewish musicians and their music.
41. The Chleuhs from Sous, chosen for their musical talent and 'souplesse d'assimilation,' were known for their 'isolement pastoral,' believed to have kept their music vital and closer to ancient Greek customs than the urban music of Algeria. Chottin, *Les Visages*, 4-7; Chottin, *Corpus de musique marocaine*, Vol. 2. *Musique et danses berbères du pays Chleuh* (Paris: Heugel, 1933); and Chottin, *Tableau de la musique marocaine* (Paris: Guethner, 1939), pp. 12, 52.
42. 'La musique classique, d'origine andalouse, art de cour et art bourgeois, complexe, savant, et raffiné', and 'la musique populaire', which could be influenced by Andalusian song, Berber music, and/or foreign music, 'turque dans la musique de cortège, nègre dans certaines confréries'. Chottin, *Tableau de la musique marocaine*, p. 107.

43. Note that Ricard was also the editor of *Corpus des tapis marocains* by the same publisher (1923-34).
44. This in turn gave rise to the first Arab theatre in Tunisia. See *La Dépêche tunisienne* (10 February 1907), *Le Courrier de Tunisie* (13 February 1907), press clipping (23 March 1909) from the Archives Nationales de Tunis, and Hamadi Ben Halima, *Un siècle de théâtre arabe en Tunisie (1907-59)* (Tunis: Publications de l'Université de Tunis, 1974).
45. See Rouanet, Introductory analysis of no. 21, «3e Recueil d'airs populaires d'Alger,» *Répertoire*.
46. Jules Rouanet, Introductory analysis of no. 8, *Répertoire*.
47. Such as Träger (1903) and Karutz (1906) in Tunisia, Smend in French West Africa (1904), Kramer in Madagascar (1906), and Lachmann (1919) in North Africa. See the collections now in the Berlin Phonogramm Archiv.
48. Ricard, 'Préface,' ii. Ironically Rouanet was later an advisor to Gramophone and some of these ethnomusicologists' transcriptions may have been based on wax cylinder recordings. *Annales africaines* (28 December 1907) announced that 'Mme Rouanet et Yafil recevront une collection de cylindres sur lesquels sont enregistrés les chants des houris du Paradis de Mahomet (musique arabe).' By 1927 Yafil himself claims to have made over two thousand phonograph recordings of indigenous airs, 'utilisant heureusement la science occidentale pour sauver les airs millénaires de l'Orient.' See also Valentin de Saint-Point, writing in *Phénix* (1927). On the recording industry in North Africa, see Ali Jihad Racy, 'Record Industry and Egyptian Traditional Music: 1904-1932' *Ethnomusicology* 20,1 (January 1976): pp. 23-48.
49. Jules Rouanet, Introductory analysis of no. 23, *Répertoire*.
50. Chottin, in his 'Avertissement,' *Corpus*, xiv, cites Albert Udry who writes in his *Les Vieilles Chansons patoises de tous les pays de France*, 'Les premières civilisations ont donné naissance à une littérature orale 'difficile' qui s'est longtemps conservée absolument pure. Nul n'avait le droit de la modifier' (13). See also Pasler, 'Race and Nation.'
51. Jules Rouanet, General Introduction, *Répertoire*.
52. Chottin, 'Avertissement,' xiv.
53. Rouanet, General Introduction.
54. Chottin, 'Avertissement,' xii. Although Rouanet gives no names in his general introduction to *Répertoire*, in 'Esquisse' (1906) he does mention the old masters and some male and female musicians who still knew this repertoire (141 and 141 n. 1).
55. Chottin, Avertissement, xii, 328. Rouanet also acknowledges the role of two Algerians in collecting or performing the musical excerpts he publishes in his 'Esquisse,' p. 215.
56. Chottin, 'Avertissement,' xiv. See also Rouanet, General Introduction.
57. Chottin, *Ibid.*, xiii; Rouanet, 'Esquisse,' p. 140.
58. Rouanet, General Introduction.
59. In his letter to M. Mahillon (7 July 1908), Laffage explained that he had sent his flyer to all Belgian cities asking for subscribers for *La Musique arabe* and only six had not responded. According to Christian Poche, *La Musique arabo-andalouse* (Paris: Actes Sud, 1995), Ben Smail was the first Moroccan to transcribe *noubas* into western notation.

60. Rouanet, 'La Musique arabe,' p. 2848. Jonathan Shannon, 'Performing al-Andalus: Mediterranean Soundings from Mashriq to Maghrib', *Journal of American Folklore*, 120, no. 477 (Summer 2007): pp. 308-344, makes a similar argument about shared Andalusian traditions in Syria and Morocco, the result of a tradition that is 'one of exile and movement' (p. 312), albeit taking very different musical and poetic forms. He concurs similarly that, 'The evolution of an Andalusian identity through music began in earnest with the efforts of French and other European scholars to document Morocco's musical patrimony during the French Protectorate over Morocco from 1912 to 1956. Prior to a 1939 conference on Andalusian music held in Fez, there are no references to the music as 'Andalusian' ... in Algeria, however, the term 'Andalusian' was applied as early as 1904 (Yafil and Rouanet 1905). ... For many of those involved in producing or marketing Andalusian music, the 'Arabian' aspects of it are downplayed in favour of its associations with Moroccan culture and with Spanish and, by extension, European culture' (pp. 321, 324). I am grateful to Jihad Racy for pointing me to this article.
61. Chottin, 'Avertissement,' xiii.
62. Ricard, 'Préface,' 14.
63. Tiersot's last volume of *Mémoires populaires des provinces de France* was published in 1928.
64. For the dominance of the 'arabo-andalouse' tradition across North Africa today, see the 2010-11 season of the Institut du Monde Arabe, Paris.

References

- Bachetarzi, M., 1968, *Mémoires (1919-1939)*, Alger: S.N.E.D.
- Baumann, E., 1905, *Les Grandes Formes de la musique. L'Œuvre de Saint-Saëns*, Paris: Editions littéraires et artistiques, p. 299.
- Bénédictus, 1889, *Musique bizarres à l'Exposition*, Paris: Harmann, pp. 18-19.
- Bhabha, H.K., 1994, 'The Postcolonial and the Postmodern' in *The Location of Culture*, London: Routledge: p. 172.
- Bert, P., 1885, *Lettres de Kabylie*, Paris: Alphonse Lemerre, pp. 6 and 34.
- Brailoiu, C., 1931, 'Esquisse d'une méthode de folklore musical', *Revue de Musicologie*, XI, p. 234.
- Bretagne, A., 1906, 'Etude sur les instruments exotiques suivie d'un Projet de création de sections musicales dans les Colonies', typescript in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Tunis.
- Broca, P., 1864, *On the Phenomena of Hybridity in the Genus Homo*, ed. C. Carter Blake, London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts, pp.16-18, 21-22, 25-28.
- Chapman H. and Frader, L., 2004, 'Introduction: Race in France' in their *Race in France: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on the Politics of Difference*, New York: Berghahn, pp. 1-3.
- Chottin, A., 1928, *Les Visages de la musique marocaine*, Rabat: Imprimerie nouvelle, pp. 4-7, 14, 16.
- Chottin, A., 1933, *Corpus de musique marocaine*, Vol. 2. *Musique et danses berbères du pays Chleuh*, Paris: Heugel, vol. 2, 25, 55, 67.
- Chottin, A., 1939, *Tableau de la musique marocaine*, Paris: Guethner, pp.12, 52, 54, 107.
- Christianowitsch, A., 1863, *Esquisse historique de la musique arabe aux temps anciens*, Cologne: Dumont-Schauberg.

- Clément, F., 1861 and 1878, *Histoire de la musique religieuse*, Paris: Firmin-Didot, p. 63.
- Collangettes, M., 1904, 'Etude sur la musique arabe,' *Journal asiatique*, November-December, pp. 365-422.
- Collangettes, M., 1906, 'Etude sur la musique arabe,' *Journal asiatique*, July-August, pp. 149-190.
- Daniel, F.S., 1868, Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique, lecture to the Société des Compositeurs in Paris on 39 May 1868, published in *Bulletins de la Société des Compositeurs de musique*, pp. 141-156, especially p. 155.
- Daniel, F.S., 1867, *A propos de chansons: Le Personnage régnant. Première lettre à Mlle Thérésa de l'Alcazar*, Paris: Noirot.
- Daniel, F.S., 1867, *A propos de chansons: La Complainte de l'ogre. Deuxième lettre à Mlle Thérésa de l'Alcazar*, Paris: Noirot.
- Daniel, F.S., 1879, *La Musique arabe, ses rapports avec la musique grecque et le chant grégorien*, Alger: Adolphe Jourdan, pp. 3-6, 8, 10, 12-14, 17-20, 28, 58, 124, 158-159, 162-163. The essays in this book originally appeared in *Revue Africaine* (1862-63), then as a book (Alger: Bastide, 1863), and later in English translation - Henry Farmer, *The Music and Musical instruments of the Arabs* (London: Reeves, 1914).
- Erlanger, Baron D', 1917, 'Au sujet de la musique arabe', *Revue tunisienne*, pp. 91-95.
- Erlanger, Baron D', 1939, *La Musique arabe*, Vol. 5, Paris; Librairie orientaliste, p. 67.
- Faidherbe and Topinard, 1873, 'Instructions sur l'Anthropologie de l'Algérie', *Bulletin de la Société de l'Anthropologie de Paris*, 8, pp. 603-659, discussed in Patricia M.E. Lorcín, *Imperial Identities; Stereotyping, Prejudice, and Race in Colonial Algeria*, London: Tauris, 1995), pp. 157, 196-197, 202, 209-210.
- Faneau, V., 1870, 'Le Chant de la meule,' *La Science social*, p. 63.
- Farmer, H., n.d., 'Notes on Arab Music' in *The Music and Musical Instruments of the Arabs*, pp. 11-13, 17-22, 204-05, 209, 218-19, 248, 252, 254.
- Farmer, H., n.d., 'Memoir,' in *The Music and Musical Instruments of the Arabs*, pp. 19 and 22, and *L'Homme* in 1870-71, pp. 11, 17-18.
- Fétis, F.-J., 1869, *Histoire générale de la musique depuis les temps les plus anciens jusqu'à nos jours*, 1, Paris: Firmin Didot, 11 and 11.
- Florida, N., 1995, *Writing the Past, Inscribing the Future: History as Prophecy in Colonial Java*, Durham: Duke University Press, discussed in Frederick Cooper and Ann Laura Stoler, 1997, 'Between Metropole and Colony,' in their *Tensions of Empire: Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World*, Berkeley: University of California Press, p. 9.
- Fouillé, A., 1895, 'Dégénérescence? Le passé et le présent de notre race,' *Revue des deux mondes* 131, pp. especially 793, 800, 804, 812-13.
- Garfi, M., 2009, *Musique et spectacle*, p. 97.
- Gastoué, A., 1931, *Corpus de la musique marocaine*, Vol. 1, in *Revue de musicologie*, November, p. 310.
- Gobineau, J.A., 1853, *Essai sur l'inégalité des races humaines*, in *Oeuvres*, Vol. 1, Paris: Gallimard, 1983, p. 791.
- Guirault, A., 1894, *Principes de colonisation et de législation coloniale*, p. 107, cited in Jacques Thobie, 1991, *Histoire de la France coloniale*, Paris: Colin, pp. 299-302.

- Irbouh, H., 2001, 'French Colonial Art Education in Morocco', *Ijele: Art eJournal of the African World*: 2, 1.
- Lacome, P., 1880, 'Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique d'après Salvador Daniel', *Revue et gazette musicale*, November, p. 363, and 5 December, p. 387.
- Lavignac, A., 1895, *La Musique et les musiciens français*, Paris: Delagrave, p. 441.
- Lavignac, A., 1922, *Encyclopédie de la musique* I, 5, Paris: Delagrave, p. 2913.
- Le Bon, G., 1894 and 1924, *The Psychology of Peoples*, New York: Stechert, pp. 37, 126.
- Leroy-Beaulieu, P., 1874 and 1886, in *De la Colonisation chez les peuples modernes*, Paris, Guillaumin, pp. 316, 330-331, 336.
- Locke, R.P., 2009, *Musical Exoticism: Images and Reflections*, Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, p.136.
- Lorcin, P., 1995, *Imperial Identities*, London/New York: I.B. Tauris/St. Martins Press, pp. 189-90.
- Loret, V., 1917, 'L'Orientalisme dans la musique française,' in *Pour la musique française*, Paris: Crès, pp. 160, 166-171.
- Lyautey, H., 1921, in a speech to at the Congrès des hautes études marocaines, 26 May, cited in Gwendolyn Wright, *The Politics of Design in French Colonial Urbanism*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991, p. 79.
- Meynard, B. de, 1865, 'Nouvelles et mélanges,' *Journal asiatique*, May-June, p. 567.
- Miliani, H., 2008, 'Présence des musique arabes en France; immigrations, diasporas, et musiques du monde,' *Migrance* 32, pp. 91-99.
- Nordau, M., 1894, *Dégénérescence*, Paris: Alcan.
- Parisot, D., 1898, *Musique orientale: Conférence prononcée dans la salle de la société Saint-Jean le 28 février 1898*, Paris: Schola Cantorum.
- Pasler, 2004, 'The Utility of Musical Instruments in the Racial and Colonial Agendas of Late Nineteenth-Century France', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* Vol. 129, No. 1 Spring, pp. 24-27.
- Pasler, J., 2006, 'Theorizing Race in 19th-century France: Music as Emblem of Identity', *Musical Quarterly* 89, 4 Winter, pp. 459-504.
- Pasler, J., 2007, 'Race and Nation: Musical Acclimatization and the Chansons Populaires in Third Republic France', *Western Music and Race*, ed. Julie Brown, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 156-58.
- Pougin, A., 1905, 'Arthur Paris et départements', *Ménéstrel*, 2 July, p. 216.
- Quatrefages, A. de, 1883, 'Acclimatation des animaux et des plantes', *Le Magasin pittoresque*, pp. 373-75.
- Quittard, H., 1906, 'L'Orientalisme musical. Saint-Saëns orientaliste', *Revue musicale*, 1 March, pp. 107-109, 111-113, 116.
- Ranger, T. O., 1975, *Dance and Society in Eastern Africa*, London: Heinemann, pp. 12-13.
- Ricard, P., n.d., 'Préface' and 'Notes sur la musique et la danse du pays chleuh', *Corpus de musique marocaine*, vols. 1, ii, v, 2, 14, 15.
- Rouanet, J., 1906, 'Esquisse pour une histoire de la musique arabe', *Mercure musical*, 15 August, pp.128, 150, 2913, 2844-2845 and *Bulletin de la Société de géographie d'Alger* (1905), p. 327.

- Rouanet J. and E.N. Yafil, 1904-23, *Répertoire de musique arabe et maure*, Alger: Yafil.
- Rouanet, J., 1905, 'La Musique Arabe', *Bulletin de la Société de géographie d'Alger*, p. 327.
- Saint-Hilaire, I.G., 1849, *Acclimatation et domestication des animaux utiles*.
- Thobie, J., 1991, *Histoire de la France coloniale*, Paris: Colin, pp. 299-302.
- Tiersot, J., 1888 and 1911, *Mémoires populaires des provinces de France* 1, Paris: Heugel, p. 1; and (1911), p. 3.
- Tiersot, J., 1889, *Musiques pittoresques, Promenades musicales à l'Exposition de 1889*, Paris: Fischbacher, pp. 77-78.
- Tiersot, J., 1894, *Les Types mélodiques dans la chanson populaire française*, Paris: Sagot, pp. 29-30.
- Tiersot, J., 1900, 'Notes d'ethnologie musicale,' *Ménestrel*, 14 October, p. 324.
- Tiersot, J., 1902, 'Notes d'ethnographie musicale,' *Ménestrel*, 16 February, p. 51.
- Todorov, T., 1993, *On Human Diversity: Nationalism, Racism, and Exoticism in French Thought*, trans. Catherine Porter, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press,
- Villoteau, G. A., 1812, *De l'état actuel de l'art musical en Egypte*, Paris: Imp. Impériale.
- Weckerkin, 1864, in 'Lecture sur la Musique des Arabes,' 26 March, *Bulletins de la Société des Compositeurs de musique*.
- Wright G., 1991, *The Politics of Design in French Colonial Urbanism*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991, p. 79.
- Young, R., 1995, *Colonialist Desire. Hybridity in Theory, Culture, and Race*, New York: Routledge, p. 18-19