

**CODESRIA GENDER SYMPOSIUM 2008**

**Gender and Citizenship in the Age of  
Globalization**

**8-10 October 2008  
Triumph Hotel,  
Cairo, Egypt**

**Symposium Report**

**Ramola Ramtohul**

**University of Cape Town**

**November 2008**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>OPENING SESSION.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>THEORIES OF LOCAL AND GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP: A GENDER PERSPECTIVE.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>MASCULINITIES, FEMININITIES AND CITIZEN IDENTITY .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>PRACTICES OF LOCAL AND GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP: A POLITICAL DIMENSION.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>LOCAL-GLOCAL GENDERED CITIZENSHIP: MODES AND PATTERNS, TENSIONS AND FLOWS .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>ROUND TABLE 1: MIGRATION AND THE GENDERED CITIZEN.....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>GLOBALISATION, GENDER AND CITIZENSHIP RIGHTS.....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>RETHINKING AFRICAN CITIZENSHIP IN A GLOBAL AGE: ALTERNATIVES FOR GENDER EQUALITY.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>ROUNDTABLE 2: GENDER THE LAW AND CITIZENSHIP.....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>SYNTHESIS AND THE WAY FORWARD.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>CLOSING SESSION.....</b>	<b>32</b>

**Day 1: Wednesday 8<sup>th</sup> October 2008**

## **OPENING SESSION**

*Prof. H. Sharawi*

The first session was opened by Prof Helmi Sharawi. He welcomed all the participants to Cairo and to the symposium on behalf of the AARC. He commended the long cooperation between AARC and CODESRIA which has spanned over two decades. He also noted that this was the fifth Gender Symposium to be held in Cairo, and that Cairo had become the headquarters of the CODESRIA Gender Symposiums. He also commemorated the 35<sup>th</sup> anniversary of CODESRIA this year and observed that the organisation has taken a diplomatic status under the UN and that over time, its governance turned towards young leadership taken over. He praised Prof. Olukoshi, who as a young thinker, had boosted academic cooperation between Arab countries in the North and African countries. Prof. Sharawi also noted that citizenship issues are being raised in Egypt and in other Arab and Islamic countries and in Africa, especially with the growing phenomenon of the feminisation of poverty. He concluded by wishing all delegates a pleasant stay in Cairo.

*Prof. A. Olukoshi*

Prof. Olukoshi was the next speaker of the opening session. He thanked Prof. Sharawi and welcomed Mrs Talawi (former foreign minister), Excellency Mohammed Fayek, Shahida El Baz and all the delegates to the Gender Symposium. He mentioned that this symposium was significant especially since it was taking place in the context of the CODESRIA general assembly which will be held in Cameroon in December. The theme selected for the general assembly, which is 'Governance of the African Public Sphere', connects with that of the gender symposium. The Gender Symposium is also significant because it marks the 35<sup>th</sup> anniversary of CODESRIA, which will be celebrated at this symposium. He noted that the participants in the 2008 Gender Symposium were diverse, coming from almost every region of the continent and this provided a strong basis to engage in truly pan-African vision of the symposium theme.

Prof. Olukoshi noted that the history of human kind had always been a story of incremental globalisation and that there are different theories of the processes of globalisation. Globalisation has not only involved and increased the awareness of human history, but it also created greater interdependence and the erosion of isolation in different ways: geographic, economic, social, cultural, etc. Moreover, the processes of globalisation not only go back far into human history but continue far-off into human future. The structures, processes and institutions of globalisation are hence not new and cannot be understood in isolation. Given that globalisation is a continuous historical flow, there is a need to distinguish the contemporary elements of this flow which distinguish it from historical ones, e.g. the volume of the flow of shares representing the connectedness of markets exemplified by the current international credit crunch at the moment. The stock markets of Africa are already affected. There has been a revolution in systems of transportation, e.g. the containerisation of goods for shipping, the ability to move of goods from one country to another in good condition, the development of aviation,

information technology which has turned the world into global village. There has also been social transformation driven by technology. These are specific and distinct elements of contemporary global process which enable us to begin to identify the key challenges that are related to contemporary issues. The process itself is however in many ways incomplete. On the one hand, the world has become very small in many ways but, on the other hand, it is still a vast world in a number of ways. This is known as the discontents of globalisation which relate to the unevenness that characterises difference and conflict in the world.

It thus becomes a challenging and empirical task to capture processes of globalisation and the challenges that it poses. In the context of the theme of the Symposium, it is important to understand the nexus between gender and citizenship in age of globalisation, e.g. the way in which theories of citizenship were developed – these were applied to national territorial spaces. At the same time, we are confronted to global processes which do not break down national boundaries but make them more porous. There is a contradiction between citizenship as defined in national territorial and in political terms and globalisation processes which challenge these boundaries. Some thinkers have moved beyond civil, legal, political dimensions of identities to go beyond the national, engaging in transnational identities. The roots of such thinking are in theories of philosophy (Aristotle, Rousseau, Machiavelli). Other thinkers have taken the social contract theory further (Marshall - social citizenship, social rights). UNRISD for instance, has invested in attempts to revive notions of social citizenship which talk of emergence of welfare states and rights of citizens in context of social and economic challenges.

Efforts have been made to try to resolve the contradiction between notions of citizenship in national and territorial spaces and to move on to a more global notion of citizenship, namely that of the cosmopolitan patriot. Here, individuals are able to relate to processes of development in several sites and Antony Apia is a key thinker on this issue. Africans experience the problem of being a cosmopolitan patriot on a daily basis. Africa is a continent of migrants but efforts to blend an identity have come up against major struggles, e.g. xenophobia, racism. Hence, in spite of globalisation, the visa regime has never been more intense, and has led to a wall of exclusion today. This occurs on a large scale, e.g. the treatment refugees are subjected to nowadays which contradicts the notions of cosmopolitan patriotism that would enable them to move across boundaries, negotiate spaces and identity. The idea of cosmopolitan patriot is therefore in many ways an ideal, and is infused with a series of obstacles and contradictions.

The declaration of the World Social Summit in Copenhagen was essentially to work towards the emergence of global citizenship. It was believed that the move would be towards a world of possibilities, mobility and technology, leading to an intensively mobile generation in history of the world. However, in spite of such declarations, nothing better underscores notion of social citizenship and governments have been unable to agree on the free mobility of labour. Multilateral agreements on investment confer home country status to FDI that flows to different countries from different sources, which points to the notion of global citizen. However, when it comes to the mobility of labour, the situation remains elusive as more and more obstacles are being erected.

Politicians and labour movements complicate the free flow of labour around the globe. Complaints are raised about migrant labourers taking the jobs of home citizens, thereby contradicting ideas of global citizen. There is also the notion of 'Immigration Choisi' put forward by French President Nicolas Sarkozy, which highlights the difficulty of notion of global citizenship. It is laden with power relations that display asymmetries of current system and raise questions of who is in better position to decide on who will be a better citizen and patriot. Hence, when it comes to the cosmopolitan patriot, individuals of a certain social class are able to move freely between countries. Transnational citizenship is being used interchangeably with the notion of global citizenship, which is the ideal. Although transnational corporations create a community of professionals from different parts of world, yet they still require some degree of protection from the home country to be able to transcend transnational boundaries, e.g. legal backing from the USA. There is a fall back on the resources of the home country in order to protect the interests of the corporation.

Relations between the theories and practice of globalisation are therefore open. The experiences of Africa help us to shape theory and define an agenda for further research and taking up the gender issues that arise is the best way to advance new theories. Feminist critiques of citizenship have led to a critique of classical theories and opening up of notions of citizenship. There is a need to bring in a whole range of social and economic considerations on the agenda to obtain a more complete understanding of citizenship. Having a progressive outlook on gender issues will also challenge the remaining deficits in theories of citizenship regarding gender issues and on globalisation to advance reflection. The papers to be presented in this symposium bring in important elements which bring in important elements to the debates and discussions on this issue.

Prof. Olukoshi thanked the delegates who had submitted papers for this symposium.

*Hon Myrvad Talawi<sup>1</sup>*

The next speaker was Hon. Myrvad Talawi, guest of honour at the symposium and Egyptian diplomat. She thanked Prof. Helmi Sharawi for inviting her to the conference, and her colleague Hon Mohamed Fayed, for encouraging her to attend. She also thanked the guests present at the symposium for the warm welcome and wished that the cooperation between Africa and the Arab countries continued and expanded. She congratulated CODESRIA for the important research work being carried out. Through the Arab Economic and Social Summit, a network is being built to connect Arab countries to African countries. The bridge between Europe and Africa had to be through the Arab countries. She mentioned that Dr Mahamud Fayed, former minister had always supported African movements and pushed Egypt closer to Africa.

---

<sup>1</sup> Myrvad Talawi is ambassador and former deputy secretary of ESCOWA in Beirut, Member of the UN Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Coordinator for the upcoming Arab Economic Summit (to take place in Kuwait, January 2009)

She considered global citizenship to be ironical because within the global system, the impact of capitalism was hypocritical as it allowed the movement of money and trade but not that of labour. There is a cry for human rights, but not for the rights of labour, e.g. foreign workers are kept out of Europe and the USA. Hence, double standards are being used. She also questioned the gains resulting from capitalism and noted that in Africa, women have made some gains, for instance, a woman became President of Liberia and Rwanda has the highest number of women in parliament. However, millions of poor women are displaced due to competition between power produces for resources such as oil and uranium. The poor have been displaced and suffer in camps, where women are exposed to sexual violence. Sexual violence has also become an accepted phenomenon in today's world. She mentioned that the existence of 'white slavery' from Eastern Europe has become accepted and that prostitution was considered to be a good source of income.

Moreover, the gains made at national level are interrupted because of the international crisis. She asked who created the food crisis, stating that it was not the developing countries but the rich countries that chose to turn food into fuel. She also questioned the cause of the rise in the price of oil to \$140, explaining that it was the doing of the rich countries compounded by competition between companies and taxes. On the financial situation in the world today, she questioned whether it was a crisis created by Nigeria or Ghana or any other African country? The market today is in recession and thousands will lose their jobs, especially women. Aid going to the developing countries will be reduced and the effects will become more visible with time.

Myrvad Talawi further explained that despite the existence of treaties to reduce customs duty on imported goods, the poor are not benefiting. The end result is that while the situation within the frontiers of the country is improving, gains will require legislation to improve the situation of women for example, which may lead to a rise in the price of oil and a financial crisis. All of these are major problems that were created by industrialised countries and imposed on developing nations. Even the climatic crisis had been caused by rich nations and the USA has refused to sign the Kyoto Protocol. Given such a situation, where is citizenship and localisation? The impact of policies on individual is not a priority. Hence, populations in the Third World had to fight for their rights. Although they had progressed in terms of rights, this progress is now being eroded by international events. She argued that decisions should not be made by rich countries alone and people in the developing world needed to have a stronger voice. The research culture in developing countries, e.g. CODESRIA, should also be preserved.

The session was concluded by self-introductions of the delegates, followed by a tea break

## **First Working Session**

### **THEORIES OF LOCAL AND GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP: A GENDER PERSPECTIVE**

#### ***Introduction***

The first working session was opened and chaired by Prof. Shahida El Baz. Prof. El Baz stated that CODESRIA produced social science research that was dialectically linked to the African reality, vision and did not negate other sources of knowledge, thereby producing a synthesis that was more useful to Africa. She stated that good researchers are the ones who are committed to change, transformation and liberation and that African integration is becoming a must, to which CODESRIA is committed. There is a need for integrated strong blocks in Africa to face global capitalism. Globalisation and its unequal power relations are an area of struggle for CODESRIA and there is a need to change the hegemonic and exploitative nature of globalisation. The African identity is important. She observed that African intellectuals in some African countries were respected, but this was not the case in all countries. There is a long delayed African self awareness which needs to be highlighted. With regard to the gender concern, Prof. El Baz noted that CODESRIA had played an important role in integrating gender with its progressive vision of societies. Gender forms part of the struggle for social transformation which involves changing gender relations. She emphasized upon the need to reflect on the kind of development that will change gender relations, especially since gender inequality is increasing at present.

#### ***Pinkie Mekgwe: Revisiting Stiwanism***

Dr Mekgwe's presentation is an overview of and reflection on African feminism. She looks at the different phases that African feminism has gone through and questions the place for citizenship in the debate. She states that Stiwanism is a concept espoused by African feminists, especially Molaria Ogundipe. It is about social transformation that included African women. Stiwanism grew out of African feminist pursuits to seek both inclusion and difference, to develop into an ideology specific to the African context. She mentions the need to review what African feminists have been saying about the issues of gender and of being an African woman. Dr Mekgwe also notes that feminism identified with the core notions in the concept of citizenship (as a legal entity, political agent, membership) especially since it is an activist movement and comprises a whole body of ideas. The African feminist has to reflect upon the meaning of being a woman, a person living in the Third World and an African because it imbues her with other layers of struggle. There is a need to look at how the African citizen has been shaped by different layers: colonial history, positioned by issues of race, women have had to defend themselves against their men, class. The debates around the issues of citizenship point to the importance of rights and participatory approaches to citizenship as a basis for a feminist theory of citizenship. There are however, tensions within feminism and Africans experience inequality in different ways. Indeed, within Africa, there are differentiations

with respect to national citizenship. Hence a key issue is whether the woman is really a citizen. Women are becoming minors due to marriage. There are also the issues of inequality at home which arise. Polarisation arises when addressing issues of identity. She mentions the notion of *Ngambika*, i.e. of men and women working together as equal citizens. She also discussed the notion of post- citizenship and what it meant for theorists of African social science, gender and citizenship, explaining that a new definition of citizenship had become important because of issues like globalisation. There was therefore a need to problematise and theorise this sphere in the African context.

***Ndeye Aminata Diagne: Le Feminisme Africain: Entre altermondialisme et development durable***

Diagne's paper looks at feminist militancy in a global context. She notes the diversity and subdivisions within feminism, i.e. Western feminism, Arab and African feminism. She questions the positions and general commitments of feminists in an increasingly global world and the status of African feminism. She also asks whether African feminists are working for sustainable development. She notes that globalisation has become a paradigm to development and that feminism has been working on the negative aspects of these issues. There are different ways in which globalisation has been understood by feminist movements. All feminists, including African feminists do not share common visions. She notes that for African feminism, as far as globalisation is concerned, the challenge is between the concern for women and the global movement for social and economic rights. She mentions two global networks of African feminists: (1) the Global March of Women, launched in Québec and which involved 1442 African feminist organisations and (2) the women's movement set up in Bamako in 1996 and headquartered in Paris, which has trained women in computer usage, creating web sites and sought to enhance their economic engagement. There is however limited inclusion of African feminists in such global feminist movements and hence a need for more feminist dialogues. Hence, the global feminist movements are not representative, and many women experience problems while trying to integrate into these movements. She questions whether this is a development alternative for African women or a new development initiative. She notes that some women's movements are in favour of sustainable development in the global context and questions the implications for African women. She believes that sustainable development is a trap and it had failed to filter to the developing world. In terms of the militancy of African feminists, the following question arises: which geopolitical trend should they militate for? She mentions three strategies: (1) to go with active militant movements, (2) to naively militate for sustainable development in a globalising world to mainstream feminist ideas. This strategy also perpetuates inequality and poverty among women in the developing world. (3) To strategically and critically work for both trends to mainstream feminist ideas (which is not easy). She also notes that it is for African feminists to take up the challenge of the issue of citizenship and that African feminist intellectuals have a role to play within social movements. The only strategy available to poor countries is to say no to exploitative global policies and to work to create critical mass of citizens who negotiate development policies and work towards sustainable development.

***Gabriela Maria Mareira da Silva: Creating Citizenship: From beneficiaries of development policies to political and social agents***

Mareira da Silva's paper looks at three key issues: citizenship and gender, women and sustainable development and, fair trade. She notes that the definitions of citizenship and gender have been dynamic and mutual through space and time. As such, the issue of social change is key to promote gender equality through social change. Although citizenship embodies universal ideas of equality, yet differences exist, which need to be taken into account when formulating policy. She argues that since citizenship concerns membership, it leads to issues of exclusion and inclusion, rights and responsibilities - civil, political and social rights which differ according to levels of citizenship. She refers to the work of Stewart (2005: 185) that citizenship has been at the centre of the dialectical relationship between domination and empowerment. She further argues that the concept of gender also varies according to culture and change in society and hence affects gender roles. She notes that sustainable development is important for a more equal and just society. It is necessary to consider women's roles when promoting gender equality and sustainable development. Sustainability requires a growing sense of belonging to the global village, sharing of resources, new life styles, collective well being, respect for human dignity and for nature, environmental protection, economic wellbeing and social equity. She observes that women often find themselves at cross roads, caught between productive and reproductive activities and that in many areas, women's capabilities and quality of life have worsened. Women are also not in the same situation of power as men, to be able to fight for their rights, often against their own cultural heritage. She mentions fair trade as a strategy to promote gender equality and lead to sustainable development. It creates an alternative commercial circuit to violent globalisation which has more respect for humans and a lower preoccupation with profit. It is also committed to gender equality, which is significant to the achievement of sustainable development. She argues that fair trade promotes the idea of global citizenship, especially as our daily routines can affect people's lives in other countries. It also gives women in small cooperatives notions of global citizenship and they become real political and social agents.

***Laroussi Amri: Femmes et citoyenneté aujourd'hui: Fondements théoriques et alternatives.***

Amri's paper looks at women's citizenship in democratic contexts based on findings from fieldwork carried out with 200 families rural in north-west Tunisia. It also draws from social sciences enlightenment theories. It critiques positivism in the context of which the women question has been analysed. Women were in fact excluded from democratic citizenship. Currently, citizenship is an exclusionary phenomenon. He mentions the European model with Maastricht treaty that favours EU citizens and excludes foreigners. Women are put before foreigners in this case. With regard to rural women in Tunisia, the findings show that rural women are poor and exploited. Women are exploited by men in Tunisia and government development plans exclude women. There is call for the reshuffling of social structures, relations of production and power relations to enable social integration. Since the research looked at the family context, it enabled an analysis of existing gender relations, especially between husband and wife in the family, and the

gender division of labour in the family, looking at reproductive and productive work. He noted that domestic and reproductive work was women's responsibility whereas men worked outside the home and handled family affairs. This differentiation of tasks has implications for gender, production and power relations in the context of citizenship which call for new approaches to analyse the issue of family, gender and citizenship which propose alternatives for women. He argues that there is a need to portray women as pivotal to economic life. Although the head of the household works outside of family, women also develop relationships with the market and this has enabled women to create wealth. There is a need to look at how to transfer feminine principle within the family. This often conflicts with the masculine principle, especially on issues of production and reproduction.

***Discussion and issues raised:***

- The concept of citizenship is complex. Three important dimensions are: (1) rights and responsibilities, (2) power and practice and (3) membership and identity. Are the resources and information to put rights into practice available at all times? With regard to membership and identity, citizenship can be oppressive and employed as a tool of dominance, causing exclusion.
- The way of thinking on gender issues have been moving from the macro social issues to the micro, i.e. family, small communities. This raises questions on power, rights and responsibility, as well as membership. There is a need to question these issues inside the family and in intimate relationships, e.g. when male taken on productive roles and women are restricted to reproductive roles.
- Global citizenship is connected to sustainable development and there is a need to think about our role as a local as well as global community. We have the power to make change by our daily choices. It is also important to put trade and the economy in the perspective of gender and development.
- The presentations adopted a top-down approach to citizenship where the state was considered to be the principal actor responsible for the implementation of public policies for citizens. The state should however not be viewed as the sole agent to implement citizenship. There is a need for political socialisation and education at grassroot level which will empower the population to be true citizens.
- In Nigeria, the concept of citizenship is complicated due to the heterogeneous society. Federal government is now encouraging intermarriages to promote unity in diversity. Women however experience problems with such government policy as they are not able to obtain good jobs in their husband's state, where they are considered to be a foreigner. Also, in her own state, the woman is seen as a temporary citizen who will be moving to her husband's state. Hence citizenship is much more complicated for women.
- There are potential obstacles arising from the dialectic between elitism and populism. Those engaged in feminist activism for the purpose of extending benefits to women constitute a negligible part of the larger women's population. They are the intellectuals, and a class issue arises. The aspiration is to reach out to everybody which raises the question of how to do so without feeding into the bias of condescension and suspicion.

- Where women are beneficiaries of development policies, how does one empower these women's groups to become political agents? How can women effectively contribute to human development? Globalisation and the development of ICTs have led to a conflict between tradition and modernity, which renders the concept of citizenship more delicate. How can one talk about civic rights and citizenship rights when women do not have rights?
- It is important to analyse citizenship in relation to particular states and countries. Most countries are presented as women. Women's attire indicates how women are supposed to behave and the current ideologies about political and ideological representation. A woman's attire therefore represents an ideology and citizenship as well. In the natural state, i.e. the patriarchal family, there is tacit acceptance of the marginalisation of women. Other active forces are nevertheless creating citizenship, e.g. national television plays a role in determining authentic citizenship. The state also does not have a monopoly over media due to globalisation, and this influences images and discourse of authentic citizenship.
- The concept of citizenship in African contexts has evolved over the years. It was defined on the basis of residence and citizenship is now defined by the state. It also entails a struggle for resources and power. Citizenship maybe therefore be best understood in terms of its contradictions, relationships of dominance and resistance, empowerment and disempowerment. Struggles over equal citizenship need more attention as full citizenship is an ideal and elusive goal.
- Much of the literature focussed on the positive or negative aspects of globalisation and drew a conclusion. The methodological approach requires more focus here. Another methodological issues is to look at the situation of women prior to globalisation, e.g. with World Bank policies. The need to consider citizenship from bottom up is an important methodological consideration
- Theories of elitism are important in the whole transformation process. There is a need to spend more time on question of globalisation, drawing the link between globalisation and gender. The different ways of expressing globalisation are changing over time rather than the process itself. Transcendence leads to various layers to citizenship and hence, the post normative becomes an important site of enquiry.

## **Second working session**

### **MASCULINITIES, FEMININITIES AND CITIZEN IDENTITY**

#### ***Mfon Umoren Ekpootu: The body as a tool: Negotiating the new Global Order Female youths in Nigeria***

Ekpootu's paper looks at the negotiations over the female body and appropriation of the female body as an economic tool, especially in the transnational sex trade. She argues that economic liberalisation and the retreat of the state have had an uneven impact on the population, especially the poor. Widespread poverty has inhibited an enabling environment for social and human development. Her work is fore grounded within the

feminist reading of the body which situates it within the larger context of unequal power relations. She looks at female youth in Nigeria within the reading of the feminist body and employs Baumeister and Vohs (2004) analytical tool, i.e. sexual economics. Commercial sex epitomises the major principles of the sexual exchange theory that women exchange sex for material resources by men. She argues that globalisation sexualises the female body. There is in fact continuous demystification of the female body which is often portrayed in the media as a sexual object and lust frontier. Women have now been able to reach out and take control of their sexuality, appropriating their bodies as an economic tool to gain societal resources. The transnational sex trade involves the migration of young women to Europe and its is driven by profit. She argues that there is a generalisation of the position of female sex traders which is contrary to what is happening on the ground. Many of the women are actually aware of what they are doing. The extent to which the 'exploitation' really occurs is therefore questionable. She notes that women finding ways to return to such activity and hence, its remunerative potential cannot be ignored. Young women are often engaged in sexual relationships with older men. They use their bodies as a means to obtain what they want and this is ingrained on campuses. Most students pay their school fees through such transactions and are therefore not ready to let go. She asks how such a situation is to be read within the feminist debates. Is sex trade and prostitution a form of appropriating or thwarting men's control, or is it a means of accepting sexual objectification. This has generated many controversies. Although attempts have been made to control and contain prostitution, but not much is done in the political context. There is therefore a need to demystify notions of sex trade.

***Felix Macharia Kiruthu: Masculinities, Femininities and Citizen Identities in a Global Era: The case study of Kiambu District in Kenya, 1980-2007***

Kiruthu uses data collected between 2002 and 2007 which was part of a research he undertook, entitled: "The History of the Informal Enterprises in Kenya: A Case Study of the Jua Kali Sector of Nairobi, 1899-1998". Kiruthu argues that women are not weak in the global era and that women have demonstrated that they are able to withstand challenges. Kiambu is near the capital and has been affected by globalisation. Men have also been marginalised by globalisation. He notes that Structural Adjustment Policies (SAPs) affected gender relations. Import Substitution Industrialisation was not cost effective. SAPs led to de-industrialisation and influx of cheap imports. It also caused a reduction in social services such as health and education. Men abandoned cash crop agriculture and trooped to shopping centres where they spent their time in idleness. The frustrated men turned to cheap alcohol for relief, thereby affecting their families. This led to street protests from women. SAPs also caused a rise in HIV/AIDS and increased poverty. Women nevertheless coped better than men with the help of social networks that they established in churches, merry go-rounds and families where they assist one another. Women did not resort to alcoholism like men. Muunguti et al. (2002) argue that women were able to cope thru long hours and by doing multiple things at same time. Many women gave up on marriage and even paid their own dowry in Kiambu. Globalisation and SAPs therefore destroyed the ability of males to provide for the family. There is a need for cultural restructuring in society to enable the male child cope with the new

demands in a globalising world. Boys need to be trained to be flexible in the socio-economic era. Government needs to adopt urgent measures to reform the economy to generate jobs and self-employment opportunities for members of society. This is the only way to address national security threats like the Mungiki gangs.

***Ivan Marowa: Masculinity, Citizen Mobility and Globalisation: Rethinking Gender in terms of Masculinity and Femininity in the 21<sup>st</sup> century with reference to Zimbabwe.***

Marowa's paper examines how globalisation is responsible for citizen mobility at national, regional and international levels, and shows that such citizen mobility is a gendered phenomenon. He argues that human society is masculine in its thinking, that whiteness is considered masculine, whereas blackness is seen as feminine. He notes that globalisation operates on a similar logic, serving within the context of feminine and masculine. He notes the increased mobility of citizens from Africa to the developed countries, leading to an interconnection between countries of the globe. The paper uses Zimbabwe as a case study and through a close examination of global economic policies and developments in terms of investment, trade, finance and technology, Marowa shows how the gendered patterns of citizen mobility are affected by masculinity and femininity in the ways of thinking. He examines how the two concepts have become central to citizen mobility in the global age in view of the African family structure and concepts. He argues that technology has impacted upon citizen mobility and the gender dynamics of that mobility. Indeed, access to technical skills which are in demand in a new technically-based economy makes both men and women mobile citizens. The paper also argues that globalisation is not devoid of masculinity and femininity thinking, as certain sectors of the global economy, like tourism and entertainment, have increased women involvement because of their reproductive services and thus trafficking of women is on the rise. Moreover, globalisation has failed to push men into women's traditionally known domestic work, which explains the gendered pattern and feminine thinking behind citizen mobility. Marowa finally argues that globalisation has remained masculine and feminine in its definition of global developments and this has affected the gendered pattern of citizen mobility.

***Discussion and issues raised:***

- The papers present a number of cross cutting issues, especially on economic crisis which leads to an identity crisis, more pertinently in gender identity as it involves a shift in power and human values.
- The analogy of the body is interesting in debates on globalisation and gender. One can draw a parallel with the rape of African continent for minerals and resources. Women are now using the body in a manner that was not traditionally acceptable. As the body has been a sacred site. Women have used their bodies to protest and agitate, for change, e.g. women are not supposed to be seen naked. Hence, is the commodification of the body leading to the empowerment for women or is it a sacrifice for a different kind of reproduction, e.g. feeding the family. To what extent

is globalisation at the root of the Nigerian case? Here there is a parallel with the Zimbabwean situation.

- There are shifts taking place in masculinities and femininities. Human values come under strain due to crisis, often leading to the devaluation of marriage. The need to exercise caution and avoid generalisations where men turn to beer, pimping and women turn to prostitution to generate wealth. It is important to find out whether such behaviour is linked to the kind of socialisation, such that when there is strain, it operates as a coping strategy. Also, if masculinity has been constructed in terms of provision for the family, is this a display of masculinity?
- Is there a connection between eastern and western European countries with regard to the exploitation of the body under a capitalist system and does body serve to any other purpose than economic exploitation?
- There are two major issues that have dominated understandings of feminism: the subordination of women and the emancipation of women.
- The need to consider globalisation from below, e.g. participation in crime.
- Another dimension of the sexual exploitation of the body in the global context occurs in the Arab region. Here it is important to analyse the impact of oil on the sexual exploitation of women. Any prudent political regime gives the women a chance to change their life. There are opportunities and hope for women to get out of the situation and to take up alternative employment.
- There is a need to problematise the concept of considering men as providers, and giving men the power to control women which often leads to gender-based violence. Alternatives should be put in place for women. Times are different in the current global context where it is not always possible for men to be providers.
- In the Nigerian context, it is necessary to probe further, at what point the question of poverty began to lead to prostitution, in a global context – to look closely at the campus i.e. what happened before and what happens now. It is also significant to analyse how Nigerian university students were being treated by the government and link the issues to the impact of SAPs on the Nigerian university system. SAPs provided the groundwork for the performance of the body, which is a demonstration of globalisation which can be both celebrated and critiqued.
- There is a need to consider the methodological conceptual challenges that arise. Firstly, the issue of causation, i.e. what causes what. There has been a strong certitude with which globalisation has been associated as being the cause of a number of issues. It might however be a conjuncture, association, correlation of a number of issues. Secondly, the category used, i.e. how to interpret change, to what extent do we give them voice? There is an assumption that the morality we impose on the processes we are interpreting is the universally accepted morality. There is a need to pay attention to the history of the body, history of sex, cultures of sex that exist. Different social contexts have different relations of sex and sensuality is constructed,. Therefore it is difficult to pronounce on an issue except in context.
- Has there been a change in women's status following the devaluation of masculinity in Kenya?
- Citizenship is described as sexualised and raced. There is also an element of choice which does not come through in the papers.

### **Third Working Session**

#### **PRACTICES OF LOCAL AND GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP: A POLITICAL DIMENSION**

***Pauline Ngo: L'exercise de la citoyenneté politique des femmes au Cameroun: Enjeux, défis et perspectives***

Ngo's paper looks at political citizenship in Cameroon from 1946 when women were enfranchised to 1990 which marked the beginning of the democratic era. The democratic electoral mandate and Constitution guarantee equality of the sexes to vote and stand for election. However, women are still heavily underrepresented in political decision-making position. Women's political citizenship is therefore in deficit. She notes that Cameroon has a conservative society and women are not able to exercise choice. As such, women's citizenship is more collective than individual. She highlights the fact that some women have been involved in militant politics, especially educated women, and such activism enabled some women to enter parliament, e.g. Delphine Tsanga in 1970. The main reasons leading to women's low political presence include male biased nomination in political parties and socio-cultural impediments. She proposes institutional reform to facilitate women's entry into the political sphere, e.g. affirmative action. There is also the need to sensitize and educate women on politics.

***Maikudi Asmau Sani: The Two Faces of Citizenship in Nigeria: A Gendered Perspective***

Asmau Sani's paper looks at women's exclusion from citizenship in Nigeria in both historical and contemporary times and the kind of responses elicited, i.e. either women demand inclusion on the same basis as men or to struggle to constitutional reform to accommodate women's specific interests. She argues that constitutional reforms in Nigeria have been selective and elitist, primarily because patriarchy dominated the Nigerian constitution. This has led to gender-based violence and women have become instruments in politics as they are used for the mobilisation of resources. There are also cultural issues which hamper women's citizenship, human rights and equal justice, such as the preference for male children, child marriages and female genital mutilation. Women's rights are therefore violated by certain cultural practices and religion is at the same time exploited by politicians. She argues that the language used in constitution is masculine, it offers a different treatment for crimes to men and women. She talks of the need for gender justice in the country.

***Rwengabo Sabastiano: Uganda's Gendered Politics since 1995: Reconstituting the Public Sphere to enhance the presence and participation of women.***

Rwengabo's paper argues that the globalisation of democracy and women's emancipation were necessary but not sufficient forces behind the reconstitution of the public sphere to enhance the presence and participation of women in Uganda. He believes that there is a need to include women in the governance of society as a reward strategy. His analysis places the two global processes - democratisation and the emancipation of women - in the perspective of citizenship. It attempts to show that men and women are 'equal' citizens in a modern state system, at least in the law. He explains how these processes further motivated the political leadership in Uganda – the National Resistance Movement (NRM) government under President Yoweri Museveni, to set up constitutional and institutional mechanisms to bring women into political and administrative arenas since 1995, as a reward for their role in the 1981-86 bush war. The paper shows how women were active as rebels, as collaborators and rebel commanders and hence, they could not be left out in the reconstruction of society. He notes that women have responded to such opportunities and secured some degree of seeming emancipation and public activeness in the midst of an emancipatory government/state environment. The paper also reveals the missing link in the struggle for women's participation in Uganda's public realm and what still needs to be done to increase and ensure meaningful participation of women in the public sphere.

***Susan Kilonzo: The plight of Women in Kisumu district after the December 2007 Kenyan General Elections: An ethnic perspective.***

Kilonzo's paper looks into the fate of Kenyan women who were affected by ethnic cleansing in the Kisumu district after the December 2007 elections. She looks at three ethnic communities in the Kisumu district: the Kikuyu, Kisii and Kamba tribes. Here she analyses the impact of ethnic cleansing on women who were in inter-tribal marriages. She noted cases of forced divorces and temporary separations for non-natives of the region. Women often had to move to refugee camps where they were vulnerable. They also experienced psychological, physical and emotional trauma and suffered economic losses. Hence, she argues that women and children suffered the most in such times of conflict. She employs the conceptual orientation of human rights issues to frame the debate. Moreover, her study also includes a qualitative aspect, which captures women's voices.

***Discussion and issues raised:***

- On the qualitative aspect of Kilonzo's paper, there is a need for information on the individuals who were interviewed, e.g. education, class, age. There is also a need to link the effects of post-election violence on women more closely to the definitions of human rights mentioned in the paper, i.e. the specific ways in which women's human rights were abused.
- On the Nigerian case study, to explain the 'pull-her-down' syndrome in greater detail as it is directly linked to women and politics. Moreover, with regard to the section on 'Islam and women', examples from Nigeria will be helpful.
- Ngo's paper needs to link more closely to the theme of the symposium, i.e. globalisation and women's political citizenship. The focus is on mapping women's

political participation and parliamentary presence. There is also the need to consider women's votes as part of their exercise of political citizenship.

- The Nigerian case study appears to blame men for women's oppression whereas the Kenyan case problematizes ethnicity.
- There is a need to define paradigms on women's representation in politics and their political leadership. What are the issues surrounding implementation? African women are reclaiming power through quotas and positive discrimination but the outlook is still negative as the elite still dominates.
- What has been the prevalence and incidence of HIV/AIDS in Kenya following electoral violence?
- Constitutions are moulded by the socio-economic and political context, as well as by the environment and ideology in society.
- Is hegemonic masculinity in Uganda supporting another type of masculinity?
- In Kenya, some women have been exploiting other women, and have sent men to beat up other women. The need to consider the exploitation of women by other women.
- There is a need to look at the issue of femocracy where first ladies collude with husbands in subordinating women (Amina Mama).

## **Day 2 - Thursday 9<sup>th</sup> October**

### **4<sup>th</sup> Working session**

#### **LOCAL-GLOCAL GENDERED CITIZENSHIP: MODES AND PATTERNS, TENSIONS AND FLOWS**

##### ***Filipe D. Santos Martins: The Places of Youth: Youth Expression and Citizenship in Cape Verde***

Santos Martins' paper looks at youth, identity and citizenship in the port city of Mindelo in Cape Verde. Cape Verde is a recent postcolonial nation. It has attained social, political and economic stability and remarkable socioeconomic and institutional development. It nevertheless suffers from high economic vulnerability due to external dependency especially on aid and income from immigrants. Despite growing urbanization, there is a growing number of juvenile youth. The youth population in this study ranges from age 15 to 39 and 197 questionnaires were administered. He adopts a double but complementary approach where the focus is on youth as a group of actors and a social category to think about social transformations in Africa. The youth are also an ambiguous group. They can be a lost generation or an innovative source of political power. They have faced political exclusion, exploitation, war and violence, lack of education and job opportunities leading to emigration. Santos Martins considers youth as a metaphor of social change. He sees a gap between representations, expectations, projects and behaviour between the younger and the older generations. The adults consider the present youth to be immoral, have exacerbated sexuality, irresponsible, no respect for the rules and limits, high consumerism, lack objectives, ambition and initiative. He questions what are the places

of youth in contemporary Cape Verde, noting that the youth still need the economic support of family and there is a lack of quality education and of jobs. There is also a growing distrust of the educational system especially as the youth are highly affected by unemployment (41.8%). He raises the issue of the body where the female body is a place where signs and ideals of race, social class and beauty interconnect. For boys, the body symbolizes strength, the military and body performance. The youth are being marginalized in mainstream citizenship, and hence they are forging their own solidarity, using the body, tactical agencies, signs and performances.

***Jacques Tshibwabwa: Etat, Mondialisation et Citoyenneté Multiculturelle: Femmes bantoues et femmes pygmées face au Genre at aux politiques publiques***

Tshibwabwa looks at the differential citizenship of two groups of women in the DRC: Bantu and Pygmy women. In the Constitution, article 14 provides for parity and there is emphasis on the promotion of women's rights in the DRC. Yet, despite the progress attained, there are still obstacles to women's full citizenship. He argues that women form a heterogeneous group and questions the relationship between Bantu and Pygmy women? He also mentions that the Ministry for Women and Social Affairs is headed by Bantu women. He asks how does the state deal with different citizenship of these two categories of women. Although Pygmies have rights on paper, they remain slaves in the way they live and relate with other people and women. There is also no Pygmy woman in parliament. He also asks how are Bantu men and women who are leading all political institutions that exclude Pygmies, handle issues regarding Pygmies? What are the intercultural dynamics between the two groups? He also questions the impact of globalization on these struggles and practices of subjugation? He sees the exclusion of Pygmy women arising from the fact that they are given a secondary status and their culture considered inferior to the Bantu culture. Here, there is a need to understand this intercultural inequality and subjugation in the context of the postcolonial state, the era of globalization and modernity. He mentions the need for inclusive governance and for policy to provide education to Pygmy women. Civil society needs to respect the cultural autonomy of the Pygmy population.

***Gertrude Owusu: Gender, Land Tenure Dynamics and Livelihoods in the Central and Volta regions of Ghana: Evidence from a methodological triangulation***

Owusu's paper makes a comparative analysis of gender differentials in access to, ownership and utilization of land. She uses gender based inequities in access to and utilization of land, which are not debatable in Africa, as the basis of her argument. The study hypothesizes that differentials exist, and hence, perceptions on access to land and control of it are gendered in relation to status, residence, migration, length of stay of the family in an area. The two regions have inherent differences and similarities, ranging from poverty levels to ecological and geographical locations. Methodological triangulation with a comparative approach was used, with quantitative and qualitative methods for data collection and analysis. The findings indicate that conflicts from all regions are common, and that gender is not critical to the access to land. Everyone has access to the parents' land if they die, whether young or old, male or female. Slight

differences exist in the general findings among regions, as in one region, land is more likely to go to the male heir and not to the female heir who will be married somewhere else. There are differences in ownership of land among men and women in the two regions; more residents in the Central Region have access to land than in the Volta Region. She notes an increasing commodification and personal acquisition of land and a growing trend of lower emphasis on group ownership. Hence, her study shows that gender per se or ethnicity in the Central and Volta regions may, to some extent, be losing their discriminatory power in determining access to land.

### ***Hezron Ndunde Otieno: Genge videos? Struggle over gender and citizenship in Kenya***

Ndunde Otieno investigates the discourse of music videos in terms of the gender representation of women in ICTs. Genge Videos are locally produced music in Kenya (local music being either called *kapuka* or *genge*). The study interrogates the interplay between global, local and youth cultures in the production and reproduction of a culture of femininity and citizenship. The music scene in Kenya shows young females claiming their space and yet music has for long remained in the masculine discourses. Women are now moving in rapidly to secure their niche in this male-dominated field. Global music plays through television (DSTV, GTV, MTV) have exposed global music videos, thus leading to a reconfiguration of local music leaning towards Western styles. Female expressions of sexuality are very visible and the videos are subverting traditional gender expressions, leading to an exposition of female sexual bodies as important instruments for finding social spaces. Ndunde Otieno argues that this has breached dominant patriarchal discourses which expect women not to expose their bodies or perform certain bodily movements or dances in public. It also threatens the traditions of patriarchal standards of female sexuality, leading to appeals for hyper-sexualised images of women. He questions whether women are now empowered or objectified.

### ***Discussion and issues raised:***

- In Santos Martins' study on the youth in Cape Verde, there is a need for greater emphasis on the acquisition of civil and political rights, rather than only on social and economic rights. It is also important to know whether a voice was given to the youth and how the youth perceived their citizenship. Can the youth fight for their rights and at the same time, abandon politics? What explains their departure from political sphere?
- Santos Martins contextualised youth as a symbol and social category. Adults were also interviewed to study the intergenerational relations. Young people express citizenship rights at the level of identities, lifestyle and values, and not only in formal participation in politics and society. Expressions of citizenship come through music and dance and also through informal groups in peripheral areas of the city. The youth have developed local solidarity activities, since they do not receive any support from government institutions. They move away from formal politics for historical reasons and lack of accountability. Youth policy isn't based on their needs but is copied on Portuguese policy and transposed to Cape Verde. Politicians seek votes, but they do

not listen to voices of the youth. The exacerbation of sexuality is caused by historical reasons, globalisation, the media, consumerism, sexual tourism and poverty.

- On the study on Bantu and Pygmy women in the DRC, there is a need to involve men in the study as it touches upon gender issues and socialisation involves the relations between men and women. Bantu women are socialised by men and women, and this develops the consciousness of these women. Are Bantu women elites? Does society enable them to implement and bring into factors towards change. What brought about this state of affairs? No empirical evidence has been presented to support claims of exclusion of pygmy women. Do pygmy women want change and to move forward? If their culture is conservative culture, they might not want to reject tradition in the name of development. Does the problem of Pygmys affect women only or the entire group? Do the Pygmy women suffer from double exclusion? Are Bantu women a homogeneous group? Or was the Tshibwabwa referring to the upper class? Do Bantu women not suffer from any form of discrimination? How do Bantu and Pygmy women relate to other men and women within the society. Are Pygmy women not doing anything to improve their situation?
- Tshibwabwa offers some clarifications to the questions. He states that gender is an analytical category in his study which looked at women exploiting other women. It is a qualitative study which focuses on the culture, how Pygmy's are seen and treated. To help the Pygmys progress will require the construction of roads and schools in areas where they live. Despite the equality of sexes in the Pygmy culture, the state discriminates against them. There are cultural prejudices. It becomes important to promote areas in which Pygmys are engaged in, e.g. fishing, to enable them to progress. Pygmys also do not have access to education.
- How does access to land relate to citizenship, access and control? Who decides on resource allocation? In Owusu's study of Ghana, religion promotes access to land and that the churches have been promoting women's agriculture and livelihood. There is increasing commodification of land in Ghana and hence, increased individual ownership of land. With the nuclearisation of families, women are inheriting land from their husbands.
- Ndunde Otieno's study presented an image of women as objects, i.e. of women being negatively viewed. Is the exhibition of body a source of income? Do the women choose the kind of work they want to do. Is this an expression of women's freedom? There is a need for visual images to support claims of the author on the images of women. Is belly dancing an art to preserve, encourage or control? Or is it a way of fighting poverty and of expressing citizenship. There is a need to characterise the context in which the dance takes place. Otieno notes that men own the studios in which women come as artists. Dance troops of women are also hired by men. He mentions that the music touches upon romantic love and physical intimacy but not socio-economic and gender issues.
- The youth and women have been framed within a normative context, involving moral judgement on women's bodies.

## **Fifth Working Session**

## ROUND TABLE 1: MIGRATION AND THE GENDERED CITIZEN

### *Prof. Shahida El Baz: Women's struggle in Egypt*

Prof El Baz explains that the women's movement is part and parcel of development of Egyptian society. It began with women's individual writings, also known as intellectual salons. In 1908, the University of Cairo was opened, women allowed to "go and only attend, not to study". Women thinkers came from aristocracy and upper classes and were educated women. They got involved in the national movement in Egypt, leading to the 1919 revolution, anti British movement and liberal revolution. Women crystallised their movement at that time. 1924 saw the formation of the Egyptian women's union. The demands were greater than before as when they functioned as NGOs. The demand was now for political rights. Young people who had studied in Europe were influenced by the modernist school of thought. In the 1930s, there were small Islamic women's groups but which were serving the ideology of Muslim brothers. This was a semi liberal time in Egypt because it was still colonised.

1945–1952 was an important period, Egyptian anti-British feeling was rising. There was active collaboration between workers and students. Women were involved as members of the communist party. However, the party did not distinguish women's issues from national issues. In the spirit of liberation, women's issues were considered divisive. In 1952 there was the movement of the army which was an anti colonial, anti feudal, anti exploitation and social justice movement. Russia – the Soviet Union helped Egypt. The revolution was taking the ideal of building the state on the socialist model. Conservative people participated in revolution. Human resources included women and men. Free education was made available for girls and boys so poor people could send their children to school. Land reform gave people land, freed them from having to make children work at expense of schooling. There was a liberation for the poor people and increase of the middle class. This period witnessed real social transformation in this period. Political participation was within a one party system. But there was greater political participation of women then than now. With state feminism, women got political rights, labour law gave equal rights to men and women. Productive labour became a value everybody believed in.

Nowadays, girls who attend university do not have much ambition but to marry a rich man. The value of money has replaced the value of productive labour. Since the women's movement at the time of Nasser, there has been no independent women's movement. NGOs have become more integrated with state and there is no active civil society in the bourgeois capitalist sense. Women had more rights now, given to them by virtue of the system. During the first half of 20<sup>th</sup> century, women's movements were very patriotic, more interested in anti colonial than in women's activities. 1952 to 1974 witnessed state feminism. Socially conservative ideology however never touched the family law that was issued in 1929 and gave man oppressive rights over women. Hence, despite the change in women's situations, the husband was still head of house. This impeded upon the real liberation of women.

Sadat changed Nasser's policies which in 1974, opened the doors to an open economic policy. The state withdrew from appointing graduates as had been done previously. The labour law equalized men and women. The public sector and private realm became a haven for women. Drug trading started in the private sector companies. Egyptians moved to the Gulf and developed conservative ideas and in the midst of unemployment and social differentiation, women were again placed to the hedge. Globalization had set in and women began supporting the ideology of women against men, that women were pushing men out of the labour market. An ideology based on Islam started distorting Quoranic teaching, seeking to push women to the periphery. The family law had not been changed. The First-Lady was leading the women's movement without providing it with direction! Women interested in change were not freed; the whole thing was not sustainable.

Globalisation and the international women's conferences have been channelling women to suit international change. The state had a women's committee in Egypt which monopolised funds and laws would not change until the first lady put pressure. Grassroot women were not aware that they could lobby as well. Globalisation has therefore marginalised the majority. Women can be emancipated in globalised labour market, but it is class determined. Some women have benefited. There are 1.8% women MPs in parliament. There is however no awareness or movement to elect more women to parliament and no talk about social democracy. There is therefore currently a lack of democracy, lack of participation, injustice, income disparities. What the women's movement was about to achieve in the 1980s has retreated to NGOs. There are however no structural NGOs which build up the capacity of people to become agents of change. Globalisation is unfortunately not really improving women's situation in Egypt.

### ***Omnia Mehna***

Omnia Mehna discusses the relationship between citizens and equality in relation to the state in Egypt. She mentions that passivity among women is positively viewed. Television has played a major role in Egypt where it is a communication and socialisation tool, especially with high illiteracy. It portrays the idea of the authentic, accepted, role model for women. Middle class passive women are presented over and over again on television soap operas.

Women's attire represents the ideology of the men in the family. The Egyptian renaissance is portrayed as a woman figure removing veil from her face and in modern Egypt, wearing western clothes is a sign of modernisation. There has been a semi-liberal transformation. Migrant workers who went to Saudi Arabia, returned with very conservative ideas and now people are beginning to wear head scarf. There is a call for women to remain at home and to cover their face. Hence, there is a reversal of ideologies towards traditionalism. Globalisation of the media with satellite channels has led to the commercialisation and demonisation of women at the same time, with double standards. Men would ask women to adopt a western look like movie stars and also to act traditional – which is contradictory.

## Day 3 - Friday 10<sup>th</sup> October 2008

### Sixth Working Session

#### GLOBALISATION, GENDER AND CITIZENSHIP RIGHTS

##### *Mounkaila Seyni: Les droits de la femme au Niger: La citoyenneté à l'épreuve de la réalité*

Seyni's paper looks at women's rights, human rights and the law and citizenship, in Niger. She argues that women's citizenship is under threat in Niger as they are not equal citizens. The democratization process has led to inequalities resulting from the patriarchal character of society. The awareness of women in Niger is recent; only till 1991 did people take on the struggle for women's rights. From a legal point of view, the Niger legal framework is responsive to human rights, following ratification of international documents and instruments, and the promulgation of domestic laws. Hence, there are sufficient legal and legislative arrangements for the protection of men and women. The constitution guarantees equality between men and women in electoral and non-electoral public participation. There are women in parliament, in cabinet and other public spaces. A national observatory to promote women's rights has been set up and departments and desks responsible for the promotion of women's rights exist in the President's and Prime Minister's offices. Hence, although the legal framework appears favourable to women's emancipation, in reality, things are different and women face major obstacles and political impediments. Women's membership in political parties is based on the position/membership of their husband. Women are instrumentalised in electoral campaigns through songs and dances. Women politicians are also concentrated in women's and social issues and women are required to conform to social values and support their husband's party. Political parties therefore use women, but women are peripheral to political action. Women are also divided by political strategies, which work against female solidarity. Women face a number of social and cultural obstacles as well. Women are considered inferior and submissive in society. The birth rate is high, with 7 children for each family, hampers women's careers. Girls' education is also jeopardised due to the high consideration attributed to marriage as the ultimate step for women. Women also face legal obstacles. The country has reservations on CEDAW, despite ratification of the protocol. It does not want to go against culture and traditions. This has been a longstanding debate between customary and international laws which guarantee women's rights. Islamists jeopardise the ratification of international treaties. In the matrimonial context, customary laws favour men, putting women at a disadvantage. Women considered a marginal, dominated group and this makes the emancipation of women difficult without the elimination of sexual stereotypes.

##### *Mustapha Ziky: Citoyenneté et Développement Humain au Maroc face aux différentes formes d'exclusion: une approche genre*

Ziky's paper analyses citizenship and development in Morocco. He studies the different forms of exclusion that the Moroccan women have experienced and how these have

caused a delay in human development. Using various theoretical constructs, he shows the need to integrate gender in human development. The active participation of women in development implies citizenship which requires behavioural and cultural changes. He explains that the international community appreciates the need for societal growth and prosperity with active participation of women, e.g. the Beijing Conference. Then citizenship involves all stakeholders in the development process. He discusses the presence of various forms of exclusion: education, health, political, social and cultural, despite the fact that the constitution provides for equality between men and women. The, the rate of illiteracy is higher among women than men, and higher among rural than urban dwellers. The situation is not improving in the near future as young girls remain illiterate and subordinate. Hence, Ziky argues that women remain at the edge of social wellbeing. The whole crisis of citizenship therefore implies delayed human development, violation of human rights especially of women, economic, social and political exclusion, as well as limited access to basic services by women. As such, exclusion can lead to a crisis of human development, while a crisis of citizenship arises from problems associated with practices, behaviours and values of society toward men and women. Abuses at household and societal levels handicap women in many ways.

***Samuel Ong'wen: Globalisation and the Gender Question: The Role of International Rights Treaties in Enhancing Women's Experience of Citizenship in Kenya***

Ong'wen investigates the role of International Rights treaties in enhancing women's experience of citizenship in Kenya. He analyses the extent to which women in Kenya have used the rights contained in these legal instruments to claim entitlements and challenge various forms of discrimination, individually and collectively. The paper draws on secondary data and policy reports of various international, governmental and non-governmental organizations. The first part of the paper outlines the nexus between globalization, citizenship and the emergence of international instruments for the promotion of women's rights and freedoms. Ong'wen shows that the process of globalization has been influenced by transportation and the ICT revolution, which have created a web of spatial interdependence and interconnectedness as well as increased exclusion and inequalities. This has hurt marginalized and vulnerable groups, especially women. He argues that national laws and policies cannot sufficiently guarantee human rights and they are being influenced by international/global instruments and actors. The neoliberal era has further marginalized people, creating ethnic and minority group tensions. He mentions possibilities to enhance human rights, to ensure gender equity and equality, economic emancipation of marginalised groups and legal provisions for the entitlements of all genders. The second part examines the development of the Universal Declaration on Human Rights and CEDAW and the extent to which government and civil society organizations have appropriated these international instruments to agitate for gender friendly legislations. The last section looks at challenges and opportunities in the application of international instruments to increase women's citizenship. He argues that international treaties lack binding effects, and that Kenya has tried to domesticate CEDAW provisions to suit national policies. One of the key challenges is the prevailing constitutional weaknesses which are supposed to curtail discrimination against women.

There is also the limited level at which women access information on rights, and international treaties. He affirms that women need to lobby for their rights.

***Ramola Ramtohul: Globalisation and Gendered Citizenship: The Mauritian Scenario***

Ramtohul studies the gendered nature of citizenship in the Mauritian context. She argues that globalisation has affected women citizenship in Mauritius in different ways, often positively. She draws on Marshall's classical definition of citizenship to highlight the gendered implications of social, economic and political citizenship and discusses these concepts in the Mauritian context. She states that globalisation with the new international division of labour and creation of the Export Processing Zone has provided an avenue towards economic autonomy to women from working class backgrounds with limited employment. Hence in this sense, globalisation benefited a class of Mauritian women. However, currently the free trade regime in the current global era threatens these women's livelihoods and they are now an older group in their forties and are more vulnerable. Moreover, she looks at the impact of globalisation on women's rights in Mauritius and gives the example of how women's movements made use of UN instruments to lobby for change in the laws governing marriage in the 1970s. This was a struggle for women as the country has a conservative and patriarchal culture which tends to resist change. The struggle for change against injustice against women became difficult because of religious sentiments. On the political front, leaders of women's organisations have drawn on the international instruments such as the Beijing declaration and the SADC Declaration on Gender and Development to lobby for change. These global instruments provided a strong case and backing to the women's lobby for political representation.

***Discussion and issues raised:***

- There is a need to explore the negative aspects of globalisation in greater depth.
- It is important to theorise divisionism and its relevance to globalising citizenship. Implicitly, the words used can be interpreted as pointing towards a society that is still engrained in traditions that opposes modern values. 'Fundamentalist' and 'conservative' are political not scientific words and may mislead. Although one can talk about forced, marriages, endogenous development, customs, patriarchal domination, etc which curtail women's emancipation, one cannot conclude that the international instruments are not in themselves curtailing women's citizenship, equality and participation. It is important to take note of the fact that tradition and modernity are not necessarily opposing. There is a need to reconsider this aspect in the light of globalisation, how can traditions also be emancipatory?
- What is the role of the state in implementation of laws? Does the population also play a role? What is the role of the elites? These are issues to consider when discussing the role of the state in the global context.
- Two important choices come out of these papers: (1) punishment of those who do not comply and the need to sensitize the population through cultural campaigns, socialisation, in family. (2) To reinforce state power and the law.

- One of the challenges with regard to the success of international conventions is whether they reach women at grassroots.
- Need to consider whether the EPZ exploits women much more than they assist them and its impact on power relations within the family?
- The impact of globalisation on female migration

## **Seventh Working Session**

### **RETHINKING AFRICAN CITIZENSHIP IN A GLOBAL AGE: ALTERNATIVES FOR GENDER EQUALITY**

#### ***Samuel Senayon Olaluwa: Not Again: Absolute Power and the Dynamics of Female Resistance in Ngugi's Wizard of the Crow***

Olaluwa posits that there is something unique in the African brand of feminism. He argues that the intervention of women in Ngugi wa Thiong'O's novel, *Wizard of the Crow*, is reminiscent of the power structure of pre-colonial Africa where women act as necessary agents of checks and balances. It points to a pragmatic way of reclaiming power and moderating it in the age of globalization. Women have always been involved in practices that marginalized their fellow women. This area of engagement is explored through an emphasis on the very strong but affably assuring personality of Nyawira, who is the leader of Movement for the Voice of the People, and how the substance of the carefully planned resistance to state aggression by subaltern subjectivities, both women and men, informs a reflective comment at the end of the novel that "To their military exercises we respond with joint political exercises with our people (762).

He argues that scholarly indications and the portrayal of women in colonial and postcolonial works, shows that several parts of Africa were emasculated and power was tilted towards men, who reconfigured and used it against women. The intervention of African feminist scholars and critics in response to issues around gender relations and the performance of power on the continent may have been received and interpreted in contested ways. One thing that distinguishes the African brand of feminism is the way in which it exonerates the pre-colonial epistemology from the allegations of extreme construction of power in masculinity. This is why many African feminists blame the historical epoch of colonialism for the erosion of female influence and relevance in the staging of power and the exercise of citizenship rights both in the public and private domains. The feminist intervention, therefore, does not only signify mourning with respect to the passage of a desirable era, but also suggests a longing for the re-actualization of the pre-colonial epistemology where women's participation was crucial to the articulation of power and exercise of citizenship rights.

Olaoluwa's paper examines Ngugi's latest novel *Wizard of the Crow* (2006) in relation to how the masculine and absolute performance of power by the state conflicts with the assertion and performance of female citizenship rights, and also how the overall dynamics of subaltern resistance to the vaulting state ambition of sinking the Republic of

Aburiria in the ocean of debts from the Global Bank of America inscribe female personalities at the centre of its structure. Therefore, rather than feeding into the biases of irrelevance, the narrative turns women into potent rallying points in the formation of moderation and revolutionary structures needed to transcend the stasis that dictatorship and sycophancy can impose on citizens in the age of globalization.

***Susanna Yene Awasom: Alternative Women Spaces and the Contestation of Citizenship of “Self” and “others” in Local Communities: The case of the Fuenbuen Women in Cameroon’s North West Province***

Awasom shows how citizenship deals with the rights and duties of people in a given community. Her paper focuses on the Fuenbuen Women’s Society as an exclusively female-constructed space for the contestation of the violation of women’s rights over land and their status as equal in a patriarchal community. Land is central to economic production and social class differentiation and women own only food crops whereas men own both the land and cash crops. Yet, all citizens have equal claims to land. The discourse of equal rights is however resisted on grounds of gender and tradition. Awasom argues that the women’s movement serves as an important component of the new civil society in the global age and can be viewed as the new actors of change and development in Cameroon’s North West Province. She explores the gender patterns of land ownership, the rights of women with regard to land tenure in rural settings; how women function in their alternative spaces and their mode of participation in public affairs, women’s contestation of their marginalization over land; and disparities in access to and control of land. She argues that the women’s society created an alternative space for the contestation of women’s marginalization on land by women. Women resorted to struggle for land in their quest for security famine. They sought equal participation as mode of ensuring their empowerment, thereby deconstructing patriarchy.

***Sharon Groenmeyer: Rethinking citizenship in a global age: A South African approach towards gender equality in intimate relationships***

Groenmeyer’s paper looks at women’s citizenship in intimate relations in South Africa, drawing on a rights-based framework formulated on the principles of gender justice that underpin the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). South Africa has also ratified the Southern African Development’s (SADC) Declaration on Gender and Development and both of these protocols bind the government to the implementation of rights-based citizenship for women. However, despite South Africa having a very progressive constitution, violence remains an integral component of the social fabric. She states that citizenship is a contested, contradictory, multi-layered, multi-tiered concept which reinforces separation of the public and private spheres. She draws on Marshall’s definition, looking at social rights as multi-tiered construct, arguing that meanings of citizenship have changed over time as people are members of a variety of collectives: local, ethnic, national and transnational. She then turns to the feminist critique of citizenship and argues that intimate citizenship concepts are steeped in heterosexual practice. Power relations within intimate relations are unequal, and patriarchal values have tried to silence women. She mentions the Jacob

Zuma rape trial which exposed some of the dominant misogynist cultural practices in South Africa. She calls for a rethinking of citizenship in the global age so that it recognizes the public and private sphere, and helps women express their sexual fears and worries. The dominant power relationships create a shift in the meaning and understanding of citizenship and hence, hinder gender equality.

***Fonkwe Prudentia Tamonkeng: The Acquisition of New Citizenship in the Global Village through the Emerging Female Chiefship in Bangwa land, Cameroon***

Tamonkeng's paper studies the way in which female chiefs and notables currently exercise power. Women have entered the privileged patriarchal sphere and would be expected to enjoy patriarchal dividends that are attached to this elevated citizenship status. However, she argues that this expectation has not transformed into reality. She states that chieftancy is a contested terrain in Cameroon although traditional authority is not contested and as such, men do not contest the appointment of women chiefs. Female chiefs and notables are well respected in society. She notes that although the female chiefs have integrated into the male frames, some staunch male chiefs would not invite female chiefs into their homes. It was never foreseen that women would command authority in the formal sphere. When a woman is given a title, the man is given also given one, but when a man is appointed chief, the wife may not be appointed. Her research shows that husbands are very supportive of women's new role. Yet, despite their higher status, women still performed the full functions of housewives and mothers at home and remained submissive to husbands. Hence, she argues that the challenge is in asserting full authority. She notes the unequal power relations between men and women, stating that the status quo has not been transformed.

***Discussion and issues raised:***

- Olaluluwa's paper raised a number of issues: The need to define African masculinity in relation to colonial Christian masculinity. What does performance of power mean and how is it expressed in the novel. How is citizenship viewed in the movement of the voice of people? To what extent to images in the Wizard of the Crow feed into or represent those of African society? How is the citizen defined in the Wizard of the Crow, does it bring out gender awareness in African society? Olaluluwa explains that African patriarchy colludes with the state to oppress women and that the value of literature is it being a field of enquiry for prospective analysis.
- Awasom's paper raised the following questions: The need to define variables of access and control and whether women have failed or succeeded in gaining access and control. The need to problematise the role of tradition in society. What has the women's society done at international level, what can be done to improve its significance? According to Awasom, when issues impact on the community, women have the ability to form pressure groups and sanction chiefs. Women are believed to have mystical powers. She notes that tradition hampers the progress of women and the village setting is centralised in terms of local politics which is generally male dominated. Women work within the frames of their own groups, exert pressure. She

argues that different groups of women have different ways of expressing their citizenship and vindicating their rights.

- Groenmeyer's paper raised the following issues – The importance of bringing in children in the study and a greater focus on women's agency in intimate settings. How do social inequalities affect the definition of citizenship in intimate settings? The need to consider historical factors, e.g. the apartheid system. A class analysis of South Africa is also helpful to look at which groups are violent and what is the source of the current violence. A psychoanalytic approach will be helpful to the analysis as each woman has a masculine aspect and gender is not a homogeneous category.
- Tamonkeng's paper raised a number of issues as well: The need to consider written laws that affect African society. The balance between the written and unwritten. Who is to blame for the current state of affairs – globalisation, women or men? The need to problematise female masculinity. How has globalisation penetrated the Bangua setup and have the traditions been evolving?

### **Eighth working session**

#### **ROUNDTABLE 2: GENDER THE LAW AND CITIZENSHIP**

##### ***Shahida El Baz: Secularism, the Law and Citizenship in the context of the Women's Movement in Egypt***

Prof El Baz began by discussing the concept of citizenship as a legal concept, bound in time and space, explaining that the criteria adopted in looking at concept should be consistent with the goals of liberation and independence and real development. She stated that concepts such as global, religions, sub-local and sub-national citizenships were historically bound. She adopted a historical perspective in her analysis of secularism, the law and citizenship in Egypt. She argued that globalisation was working to destroy nation state. Regional integration requires successful democratic and strong states. In countries where there have been conflicts between secularism and religion, such as Egypt, religion was used to weaken national identity and citizenship. She noted that Egyptian women have a reduced and incomplete citizenship. Although gender equality does not prevail in Egypt yet, there is a movement towards it and also a lot of resistance to it. In the legal system, the laws do not discriminate between men and women, but cultural elements give different meanings to inequality. Egypt initially had some reservations on the CEDAW protocol but recently abolished the reservations.

The Constitution provides for gender equality in article 40 which guarantees equality of all citizens. Women have the right to work and the state is responsible to help women reconcile domestic responsibilities and participation in the workforce. The new Constitution however has a new article, Sharia, which means that men source all laws. This gave the opportunity to fundamentalists to question the laws on the basis of Sharia and for people to question women's participation in the public sphere. Egyptian women enjoy rights to land but they cannot inherit land unless they go to court. Hence, there are still a number of discriminatory laws which affect women's citizenship. For example,

men have the sole to divorce a woman, even in her absence. Family law therefore makes women insecure. The inequality in private sphere is reflected in the public sphere as women are increasingly dependent on men, emotionally, and otherwise. With the struggle of women's movements, a new law called Exhola was introduced, enabling women to go to court and divorce a man. However, Prof. El Baz remarked that judges were conservative and women were losing out despite the legal provision. She also noted that the private sector was hostile to employing women and there had been a regression in women's rights in the new labour laws as a consequence of globalisation.

***Lindiwe Farlane: Health, the Law and Gendered Citizenship in the context of South Africa***

Farlane questions the evolution of solidarity between men and women and the source of the battle of sexes. She states that challenges are different today. She highlights the Women's March to the Union Building in 1956 and how women raised children when the male political prisoners were arrested. She thus questions whether there is a change today for the women? She looks at the exodus of health professionals from South Africa and the HIV/AIDS pandemic. South Africa young women bear the brunt of the disease and this is a thus a new struggle for women. She interviewed women below 25 on their reproductive desires for this study. Her findings show that women are expected to have children. There is a strong belief that the partner wants a child and that a child brings joy, strength and courage. There is also an underlying fear of infecting the child or partner. The state has been giving mixed messages, especially from Mbeki and Manto Tshabala, denying the seriousness and extent of the problem. This attitude is affecting vulnerable groups, especially young women and children. Although male circumcision protects men from AIDS, young women have limited ways to protect themselves, making them vulnerable citizens.

***Rebecca Quionie Bowao: Justice and the Gendered Citizen in Africa***

Bowao's paper looks at the legal parameters around gender and sexuality and these are affected by globalisation. She notes that justice in Africa encompasses the global framework of the international community. International principles within globalisation are enacted through the UN charter of 1945 which defined human rights. Poor African countries have ratified these international legal instruments and judicial institutions now have the legal instruments to perform their work. Some countries have not ratified certain conventions (e.g. Nigeria has not ratified the charter on women), although these would protect women from discrimination and marginalisation. National constitutions have been adopted in the context of military as well as patrimonial regimes, which are pressured by the international community to adopt certain laws. Thus globalisation is prescribing and, at the same time imposing justice mechanisms and instruments on African countries. She argues that there is a need to go beyond the mercantile approach as globalisation concerns the universal recognition of gender and equality. With regard to the protection of women by African law, she notes the existence of a number of loopholes. There is no real suppression of adultery and sex is considered to be sacred and the security of the family. She talks of the need for the same treatment and punishment for men and women on

issues of adultery. Moreover, Africa faces a problem of voluntary transmission of HIV/AIDS. Despite the condemnation of rape in South Africa and the DRC for example, perpetrators often benefit from amnesty in a spirit of national reconciliation, thereby denying justice to the victims. Poverty also causes ignorance and affects people's access to legal instruments, denying them some of their rights as citizens. She notes that women are still vulnerable despite legal protections as actions to implement legal clauses have been slow.

***Discussion and issues raised:***

- Gender policy is instrumentalised to serve the narrow ends of political elites and not necessarily concerns of women. Need to look at the contribution of the female elite in Africa to women's condition.
- International institutions affect women's rights and status e.g. the IMF and World Bank policies – SAPs which sidelined human rights for economic growth. There is a need for a human dimension of global governance.
- Citizenship in context of solidarity is an important issue. Concept of solidarity, community and family brought notion of citizenship.
- The existence of contradictions in the actions of women's movements. Women's issues are no longer militant issues as in past, and more of a profiteering issue. Women's liberation has to be a struggle for liberation. Foreign funding makes actors dependent and leads to competition between women which jeopardises women's issues. Donors have been turning women's movements into NGOs.

**Ninth Working Session**

**SYNTHESIS AND THE WAY FORWARD**

**Ramola Ramtohol** highlights the significance of the historical dimension of globalisation and citizenship. She notes the uneven impact of globalisation on the citizenship of individuals. Key determinants of the impact of globalisation on citizenship are country history, level of development, culture – all of which have gender dimensions. In the African context, she highlights the fact that women had a higher status in pre-colonial times. Hence, the timeframe of analysis and context are important and care should be taken when employing Western theories. She also raises the issue of the impact of globalisation on the citizenship of the gay, lesbian and transgender community, which had not been discussed during the symposium. Here the specificities of the African context are also significant.

**Susanna Yene Awasom** underscores the fact that citizenship is complex and the symposium has extensively explored a number of areas. Methodological issues have been discussed, the difference between passive and active citizenship has been made and citizenship has been analysed at both micro and macro levels. She discusses the formulation of transnational citizenships and the importance of the psychological

dimension. She refers to Wallerstein when discussing the reality of prevalent inequalities in the modern world system. She then asks how to reconcile the theoretical aspect of equality and existing polarisation which is the reality. Here, she notes the need for citizens to play an active role and participate in community activities. Women should not be excluded from participation because of their sex. She also remarks that CODESRIA is de-feminising marginalised struggles by involving men in the debate. She mentions the intergenerational presence of men at gender symposium. CODESRIA has successfully contributed to the making of transnational citizens in the African academic community

**Jacques Tshibwabwa** takes note of the fact that theoretical issues had been thoroughly addressed at the symposium, compared to the previous year. He mentions the identity issue which came up in some of the presentations and the notion of cosmopolitan patriotism in a global world. Factors that hinder the fostering of global citizenship have been analysed. He also observes that globalisation brings up the need for new theoretical, epistemological issues especially since citizenship is a dynamic concept. He argues that African feminism needs to be re-invented and re-thought to be representative. Moreover, the body is a contentious issue and needs to be contextualised. He also states that most of the discussions had concentrated on state centred citizenship and there was a need to look at 'citizenship from below', i.e. how do communities cope, e.g. in situations of conflict and war where constitutions are put forward by rebels and war lords. What does citizenship in rebel spaces mean for the population? There is a need to study the role of local authorities with regard to citizenship. He notes that sexual citizenship is an important dimension of the debates on globalisation and citizenship

**Pinkie Mekgwe** states that the objective of CODESRIA regarding gender is to increase knowledge on the gender issue, strengthen gender research and analysis in Africa and to explore new areas of research. She highlights a number of key concepts in the debates on globalisation, gender and citizenship: gender/feminism, citizenship – full v/s equal, globalisation – historicization, masculinity - crisis or shift, femininity – fluid or besieged, change/transformation, alternatives- the lower, the more, voice/representation – class, hierarchization and power – whether phallogocentric.

She discusses the issues arising on the theoretical aspects. There is a need to explore to what effect, on whose terms/what, Canonisation – does it move us towards alternative theories to citizenship, and should we go beyond normative definitions? She notes that African feminism is contested and is a refraction of citizenship challenges. Another important theoretical issue is that of male studies and masculinities in Africa– what are the implications for an area which is generating interest in African studies. There is also the issues of endogamous and exogenous, tradition and modernity, globalisation, modernity and conservatism. In this context, diasporic, transnational family networks tend to impose old traditions which have implications with respect to globalisation

Pinkie Mekgwe also brings out a number of methodological issues. There is a need for positioning, insertion and objectivity. Here, she talks about the ethics of researching Africa and mentions the work of Amina Mama. With regard to causation, i.e. looking at history and voice, she notes that the 'how' has always implicated in the 'what' and for

‘what’. There is also the comparative which needs to be spatial, temporal and gendered. It becomes important to go beyond numbers in assessing gender transformative progress. She highlights the need for studies to be creative, composite and inclusive. Dr Megwe then discussed some issues for research on the youth, the body, violence and rights/culture. There are still some challenges on the issue of gender, globalisation and citizenship which require further exploration. She mentions the following: democracy, male feminism/female masculinity, intimate citizenship and the politics of motherism, citizenship and sports and ICTs gender and citizenship.

She concludes with a discussion of the strategy of CODESRIA, which is to attend to issues relevant to African development and gender transformation. It seeks research with rigour, voice, engagement with a global audience and this dictates the selection of papers for the symposium. She reminds the participants of the deadline of 31<sup>st</sup> March 2009 to submit their revised papers.

### *Issues raised by the audience*

- The interconnectedness and link between the public and private sphere is central to gender issues and gender analysis. One cannot tackle inequalities in social structures without observing intimate social relations. Ideologies based on political and economic standards are failing, possibly because they are not linked to intimacy. Global and social structures shape our personal lives, but personal lives also affect these structures.
- The dichotomy between the West and the rest as globalized and globalizer needs to be revisited. African scholars should go beyond dichotomies. CODESRIA should also invest in African researchers’ study of western cultures. This could bring new insights to African social sciences.
- Masculinities did not receive sufficient focus, e.g. the plight of older men who are retired from public service and unable to cope with life in rural areas. They do not live very long and their wives often leave to move in with the children working overseas or in the cities.
- The need for greater focus on the issue of regional integration in Africa. What will happen to citizenship within African union? How is African citizenship affected? There is also a need to study mobility within different parts of the continent.

## **CLOSING SESSION**

**Prof Helmi Sharawy** thanked all delegates for coming to Cairo and for bringing the different papers, presentations and discussions which will be helpful in establishing the African community on gender. He reminded the audience that the gender symposium has been regularly held since the past five years. He thanked Prof Olukoshi, Pinkie Megkwe and Sokhna Toure for the success of the symposium. He noted that the discussions will set the roadmap for the next phase of work of CODESRIA. He thanked everybody and hoped to see them in Cairo at the next gender symposium.

**Prof Adebayo Olukoshi** was the last speaker in this session. He mentioned that this was the last gender symposium he was attending in as Executive Secretary of CODESRIA. Since the past eight years that he has been at CODESRIA, he observes that the organisation has travelled a long road with considerable degree of success in gender research. There are still more challenges ahead. He recalls the first encounter with gender in a highly contested General Assembly on the theme of democratic transitions in Dakar. On the third day of assembly the question of why the voices of women were absent or marginalised in the production of African social science knowledge came up. The assembly was polarised and women who were at the forefront of the gender campaign mobilised some scholars who came up with a resolution which began to set the framework of CODESRIA's serious engagement with gender. Previously, themes had centred around issues of class and ethnicity. The first gender symposium was held in 1992 on the theme 'Engendering African Social Sciences' and papers of that symposium came from some of the most militant voices in Africa on gender. Very few men were present at that gender symposium. The council however did not institutionalise the gender symposium at that time. The gender symposium was later revived and made a permanent feature of CODESRIA's research strategy. It creates a framework and mechanism so that a maximum number of participants are given a fair chance. The council abolished the notion of entitlement and calls for papers are now open. The aim is to attract participation from different perspectives and different walks of life as gender embraces far more approaches than participants in gender research might accept or consider.

Prof Olukoshi then discussed the strategic objectives in reviving symposium. In the light of transitions in African higher education, it became important to begin to nurture a new and younger generation of gender researchers in the continent who are networked with one another, in the same way as the pioneer researchers were. The latter are retiring or have relocated out of Africa. Hence, there is a need to nurture a new generation of researchers within universities who will carry on the struggle. He remarked that the process of renewing the networks had been successful and a number of younger researchers were present among participants. The goal was to develop competence in gender research and to bring the results of work to gender symposium.

Another strategy touched upon actors carrying out gender research. He highlighted the fact that one could not do gender research meaningfully if it was only a women's affair. There was a need to change that mentality and to target young male scholars and encourage them to specialise in gender studies. CODESRIA has created a critical mass of male scholars in gender studies. This is important for projects of transformation on the continent and social change.

The third strategy looks at the need to shift frontiers of gender research. He mentions Walter Oyugi from Kenya who talks of high science but devalues domestic violence and other social issues. Yet, these are not trivial matters, they are real issues, of choice, political issues, matters of life and death. CODESRIA is determined to strengthen research in these areas, i.e. the gender element in high science, history, economics and

break down the divisions of labour where women are supposed to do mundane things of reproductive health. Topics for the gender institute and gender symposium were consciously selected so that they did not reflect orthodox issues.

The challenge that lies ahead of Africans as a community is that of theory, method and evidence. Investments need to be made in theory building, methods and building evidence locally so that Africans synthesize and analyse their own data. Comparative work needs to be carried out as a community. A critique of African Studies has been undertaken. Africans who study the continent may under-develop themselves arguing over bias. He mentions that this is the time to rise above such bias and CODESRIA is prepared to lead the process by sending African scholars overseas to study other contexts in Europe, the USA etc. There has also been an engagement with China. CODESRIA has received 40 invitations to discuss Africa in relation to China. These were turned down because CODESRIA wants to have Africans study the city of Beijing, or Shanghai. He notes the excessive scientific impunity in African studies. Short cuts in methods for instance, jeopardise African studies. Investments are necessary to enrich the field of African studies so that it serves the purpose of transformation.

Prof. Olukoshi thanked all participants for their contribution, discipline, and forbearance in making the symposium the success that it had been. He thanked Prof Helmi Sharawy for the support over the years, Prof Shahida El Baz, his colleagues at CODESRIA - Pinkie Megkwe and Sokhna Toure and the interpreters for the good translation. He stated that Cairo was chosen for a political reason as Egypt was in Africa. He wished everyone a safe journey back home and said that he would remain an active member of CODESRIA. He also welcomed everyone to the General Assembly symposium in December which will be major scientific exchange.